

New
Challenges
 New Tools
for Defense
Decisionmaking

Stuart E. Johnson Martin C. Libicki Gregory F. Treverton

Bruce W. Bennett Nurith Bernstein Frank Camm

David S.C. Chu Paul K. Davis Daniel B. Fox James R. Hosek

David Mussington Stuart H. Starr Harry J. Thie

RAND

This publication was supported by RAND using its own funds.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

New challenges, new tools for defense decisionmaking / edited by Stuart Johnson,
Martin Libicki, Gregory F. Treverton.

p. cm.

“MR-1576.”

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 0-8330-3292-5 — ISBN 0-8330-3289-5 (pbk.)

1. United States—Military policy—Decision making. 2. National security—
United States. 3. United States—Defenses. 4. World politics—21st century. I.
Johnson, Stuart E., 1944— II. Libicki, Martin C. III. Treverton, Gregory F.

UA23 .N374 2003

355'.033573—dc21

2002190880

RAND is a nonprofit institution that helps improve policy and decisionmaking through research and analysis. RAND® is a registered trademark. RAND's publications do not necessarily reflect the opinions or policies of its research sponsors.

© Copyright 2003 RAND

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from RAND.

Published 2003 by RAND

1700 Main Street, P.O. Box 2138, Santa Monica, CA 90407-2138

1200 South Hayes Street, Arlington, VA 22202-5050

201 North Craig Street, Suite 202, Pittsburgh, PA 15213-1516

RAND URL: <http://www.rand.org/>

To order RAND documents or to obtain additional information,
contact Distribution Services: Telephone: (310) 451-7002;

Fax: (310) 451-6915; Email: order@rand.org

PREFACE

This book contains thirteen papers that, collectively, provide a wide variety of perspectives on future defense decisionmaking. The topics range from the global security environment, to tools for assessing both military manpower and information systems, to general techniques for gauging the adequacy of military forces, to specific techniques for improving defense decisionmaking, especially under conditions of uncertainty. The papers were originally delivered as lectures in a short-course series, “Defense Analysis for the 21st Century,” that was sponsored by the RAND Graduate School and held in RAND’s Washington, DC, offices.

The rethinking of defense planning will continue apace, spurred in particular by September 11, 2001, and the war against terrorism; but many of the ideas and conclusions presented here will retain their relevance for years to come. While no attempt has been made to develop a monolithic “RAND view” on the many challenges defense planners face, readers will see in this collection themes and methodologies characteristic of RAND’s recent defense planning work. It is hoped that these will be of interest to a broad class of individuals in government, military service, universities, and industry. The intention has been to provide papers that both describe enough of the research and analytic reasoning to convey a sense of how the work was done and present findings that should be useful for some time to come.

Most of the research underlying the papers in this book was conducted in RAND’s three national security federally funded research and development centers (FFRDCs): Project AIR FORCE, the Arroyo

Center, and the National Defense Research Institute (NDRI). These three centers are sponsored, respectively, by the Air Force, the Army, and the Office of the Secretary of Defense and the Joint Staff.

RAND's National Security Research Division oversaw the preparation of this book for distribution within the defense analysis community. This activity was made possible by funding from RAND's continuing program of self-sponsored independent research, which is derived, in part, from the independent research and development provisions of RAND's contracts for the operation of its three U.S. Department of Defense FFRDCs.

CONTENTS

Preface	iii
Figures	xi
Tables	xv
Acknowledgments	xvii
Abbreviations	xix
INTRODUCTION	1
From Old Challenges to New	2
How This Volume Is Organized	6
Part I. New Challenges for Defense	
INTRODUCTION TO PART I	10
Chapter One	
DECISIONMAKING FOR DEFENSE	
<i>David S.C. Chu and Nurith Berstein</i>	13
Deciding What Decisions Must Be Made	14
Deciding Who Makes the Decisions	15
Deciding How to Allocate Resources	19
Deciding What Investments to Make	22
Alternative Approaches to Decisionmaking	27
Alternative Decisionmaking Styles	29
Looking to the Future	31

Chapter Two	
RESPONDING TO ASYMMETRIC THREATS	
<i>Bruce W. Bennett</i>	33
From the Cold War to the Present	34
Examples of Asymmetric Threats	39
How Would Adversaries Shape Asymmetric Threats?	40
The Importance of Surprise and Anonymity	43
Challenge and Response Cycles	45
The Challenge of Weapons of Mass Destruction	47
A Framework for Responding to Asymmetric Threats	49
Institutionalization Through Protection	50
Institutionalization Through Threat Management	56
Internationalization	63
Conclusions	66
Chapter Three	
WHAT INFORMATION ARCHITECTURE FOR DEFENSE?	
<i>Martin C. Libicki</i>	67
What Is Architecture?	68
The Global Information Grid	70
Need There Be Architecture?	72
Architecture Follows Culture?	73
DoD as an Institution in Its Own League	74
Elements of Architecture	78
Collection	78
Access	80
Presentation	82
Networking	84
Knowledge Maintenance and Management	86
Security	89
Interoperability	90
Integration	93
The Need to Think Now	94
Part II. Coping with Uncertainty	
INTRODUCTION TO PART II	98

Chapter Four	
INCORPORATING INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY IN DEFENSE PLANNING	
<i>Martin C. Libicki</i>	103
Modest Propositions About the Future	103
Real Revolutions on the Physical Battlefield	107
Hitting What Can Be Seen	107
From Contingency to Necessity	112
The Coming Architecture of Military Organization	114
Conventional War, Hyperwar, and Mud Warfare	117
False Revolutions on the Virtual Battlefield	119
What Is Information Warfare?	119
Antisensor Operations	121
Electronic Warfare	123
Command-and-Control Warfare	124
Psychological Operations	125
The Ghost in the Machine	126
The Lesson of September 11	128
Chapter Five	
UNCERTAINTY-SENSITIVE PLANNING	
<i>Paul K. Davis</i>	131
Why So Many Surprises?	132
Conceptual Strategic Planning	134
Uncertainty-Sensitive Strategic Planning	134
Operationalizing Strategic Planning in Portfolio- Management Terms	138
Capabilities-Based Planning	141
Key Features	142
Information Technology and Mission-System Analysis	144
Multiple Objectives and Measures	145
The Concept of a Scenario Space (an Assumptions Space)	146
Choices and Resource Allocation	151
Chapter Six	
PLANNING THE FUTURE MILITARY WORKFORCE	
<i>Harry J. Thie</i>	157
Military Human Capital	159

Historical Size, Source, and Composition of the Active Force	159
Ongoing Revolutions: Composition, Characteristics, and Attributes	165
Looking to the Future	169
Manpower and Personnel Analysis	172
The Process	172
Choosing Among Alternatives, an Example	174
Chapter Seven	
THE SOLDIER OF THE 21st CENTURY	
<i>James R. Hosek</i>	181
Visions of the Future	182
Cyber Soldier	182
Information Warrior	183
Peace Operations	184
Rapid Response Force	184
Low-Manning Vessels	184
Evolutionary Change	185
Experience of the All-Volunteer Force	186
Versatility and Leadership	187
Attracting Quality Personnel	189
Economic Theories of Compensation	199
Issues for the Future	207
Chapter Eight	
ADAPTING BEST COMMERCIAL PRACTICES TO DEFENSE	
<i>Frank Camm</i>	211
What Is a Best Commercial Practice?	213
Examples	213
Commercial Practice: Neither Monolithic nor Easy to Define	214
Why DoD Should Care	215
A BCP That DoD Uses Today: Lean Production	217
What About Best Government Practice?	218
Operational Total Quality Management and BCPs	219
Key Benefits of TQM: Links Between Customers and Processes, and Continuous Improvement of Resulting System	219

TQM Viewed with Great Suspicion by Many in DoD . . .	222
Identifying BCPs	223
Adapting BCPs for Use in DoD	224
Structural Differences Between DoD and Most Best Commercial Firms	227
An Illustrative Example: Strategic Sourcing as a Basket of BCPs	231
BCPs Relevant to DoD’s Strategic Goals	233
Key Barriers to DoD’s Adaptation of Sourcing BCPs . . .	239
Insights from Commercial Experience on Overcoming Key Barriers	242
Part III. New Tools for Defense Decisionmaking	
INTRODUCTION TO PART III	248
Chapter Nine	
EXPLORATORY ANALYSIS AND IMPLICATIONS FOR MODELING	
<i>Paul K. Davis</i>	255
Introduction	255
Exploratory Analysis	256
Definition	256
Types of Uncertainty in Modeling	258
Types of Exploratory Analysis	259
Enabling Exploratory Analysis	265
Using Occam’s Razor	269
Multiresolution, Multiperspective Modeling and Model Families	270
Lessons from Recent Experience	278
Appendix : Reflecting Uncertainty with Parameters, an Example	282
Chapter Ten	
USING EXPLORATORY MODELING	
<i>Daniel B. Fox</i>	285
The Need for Exploratory Modeling	285
The Joint Integrated Contingency Model	286
Sensitivity Analysis and Exploratory Modeling	288
Doing Exploratory Modeling	290
The Value of Exploratory Modeling	297

Chapter Eleven	
ASSESSING MILITARY INFORMATION SYSTEMS	
<i>Stuart H. Starr</i>	299
Historical Perspective	300
Context for Assessing Military Information Systems in the 21st Century	304
Additional Complicating and Supporting Factors	307
NATO Code of Best Practice	309
Advances over the Past 25 Years	319
Residual Challenges: A New Agenda	320
Chapter Twelve	
THE “DAY AFTER” METHODOLOGY AND NATIONAL SECURITY ANALYSIS	
<i>David Mussington</i>	323
The Methodology in Brief	324
Applications and Exercise Development	326
Strategic Information Warfare	327
Cyberpayments and Money Laundering	330
Comparison of the Two Implementations of the Methodology	333
The Day After and Analytic Independence	335
The Value of the Day After	337
Chapter Thirteen	
USING ELECTRONIC MEETING SYSTEMS TO AID DEFENSE DECISIONS	
<i>Stuart E. Johnson</i>	339
Electronic Meeting Systems	340
Prioritizing Naval Programs: An Example of an EMS in Use	342
The Challenge	342
Overview of Methodology	344
Other Possible Uses	358
AFTERWORD	361
Index	363
About the Authors	389

FIGURES

2.1.	Symmetric View of Military Power	37
2.2.	How Adversaries Might Use Asymmetric Threats	38
2.3.	U.S. Requirements for Military Power Projection	41
2.4.	Shortcomings of Today's Means of Force Protection Against CBW	51
2.5.	Current Passive Defense Efforts	55
4.1.	The Move from Platform-Based to Knowledge-Based Warfare	115
4.2.	Five Types of Information Warfare	121
5.1.	Uncertainty-Sensitive Planning	135
5.2.	Defense Planning in a Portfolio-Management Framework	139
5.3.	An Illustrative Threat-Based Scenario	142
5.4.	Contrasting Types of Analysis	145
5.5.	Exploratory Analysis in a Scenario Space	146
5.6.	Fault Tree for Defense of Kuwait and Saudi Arabia	149
5.7.	One Slice Through Outcome Space, Showing Envelopes of Capability for Defense	150
5.8.	Factors to Be Reflected in Portfolio Analysis	152
5.9.	Basic High-Level Scorecard Structure	153
5.10.	DynaRank Outputs in Cost-Effectiveness Analysis	154
5.11.	Exploratory Analysis Showing Rank-Ordered Preferences Under Different Views	155
6.1.	Size of Active-Duty Military, 1800–2000	160
6.2.	Ratio of Enlisted Personnel to Officers, 1800–2000	161
6.3.	Occupational Mix, 1865–2000	163
6.4.	Active Military as Percentage of Population, 1800–2000	164

6.5.	Defense Manpower Composition, 1958–2000	165
6.6.	Percentage of Enlisted Accessions in Highest Three Training Aptitude Categories, 1952–2000	167
6.7.	Educational Achievement for Grades E6 to E9, Selected Years	168
6.8.	Educational Achievement for Grades E6 to E9, by Occupation, Selected Years	169
6.9.	Model of Complex Relationships	178
8.1.	A Continuous Improvement Loop Indicating Whether Adaptation Is on Track	230
9.1.	Virtues of a Family of Models (Including Human Games)	257
9.2.	Data View Display of Parametric Exploration	261
9.3.	Analytica Display of Parametric Exploration (Simultaneous Exploration of Nine Parameters)	263
9.4.	Display of “Probabilistic” Exploration	264
9.5.	Multiresolution Family of Models	271
9.6.	Mutual Calibration of a Family of Models	273
9.7.	Input to Higher-Level Model May Be Stochastic	277
9.8.	A Multiresolution, Multiperspective Design for Salvo-Impact-Time Module	280
10.1.	JICM Functional Submodels	287
10.2.	Hours or Computers Required for Simulation Runs	290
10.3.	Coded Measure of Outcome	292
10.4.	Exploring Access and Warning	293
10.5.	Exploring Access, Warning, and Mines	294
10.6.	Exploring Access, Warning, and Chemicals	294
10.7.	Exploring Chemicals, Mines, and Access	295
10.8.	Exploring ABAT, SCAV, and NBAT	295
10.9.	Exploring ABAT and SCAV When Chemicals Are Used	296
11.1.	A Business Process Reengineering Perspective of Information Assessment (1975–1985)	301
11.2.	Phases of the Mission Oriented Approach	303
11.3.	NATO COBP Assessment Methodology	311
11.4.	The Scenario Framework	312
11.5.	Relationships Among Classes of Measures of Merit	313
11.6.	Representative CAPE Output: Targets at Risk	317

12.1. Generic Schematic of Day After Exercise Methodology	325
13.1. Collaboration Across Time and Space	340
13.2. Analytic Approach, Phase I	345
13.3. Analytic Approach, Phase II	345
13.4. Responses to “The Military Is Likely to Be Called on to Carry Out This Activity”	349
13.5. Responses to “Not Performing This Activity Successfully Poses Significant Risks to U.S. National Security”	349
13.6. Ranking of the Importance of Military Activities	350
13.7. Responses to “This Activity Is Likely to Be Performed Primarily by Naval Forces”	352
13.8. Responses to “Naval Forces Are Critical to the Performance of This Activity”	352
13.9. Ranking of the Relevance of Naval Forces in Carrying Out Key Military Activities	353
13.10. Ranking of the “Utility” of Naval Forces	353
13.11. Capabilities Ordered According to Their Contribution to Weighted Activities Naval Forces Are Likely to Be Called on to Carry Out	355
13.12. Weighted (Joint) Priority of Largest Navy Programs	357

TABLES

2.1	Comparing Weapons of Mass Destruction	48
3.1	A Two-by-Two Categorization of War	76
4.1	C4ISR Requirements for Conventional War, Hyperwar, and Mud Warfare	118
5.1	Illustrative Experimental Plan: Scenario-Space Analysis of Defense Capability for a Given Name- Level Scenario	148
6.1	Variables and Measures for Objectives	175
6.2	Policy Alternatives Applicable to an Entire Military Service	176
6.3	Policy Alternatives Applicable to Units Within a Service	176
6.4	Policy Alternatives Applicable to Individuals	177
7.1	Comparing the Six Visions of the Future in Terms of Needed Changes	186
7.2	Factors Affecting Personnel Productivity	191
7.3	Percentage of Recruits That Are High School Graduates and Percentage That Are High Quality, by Service and Year	193
7.4	Average Years of Service and Percent Increase in Mean Years for Enlisted Personnel and Officers	194
7.5	Enlistment Figures for 18-Year-Olds, 1955–2000	199
8.1	Sources Used for Ideas on BCPs	234
8.2	Summary of Openings for and Barriers to Air Force Adaptation of BCPs	236
8.3	Possible DoD Approaches to Strategic Sourcing	243
11.1	A New DoD Context	305
11.2	New DoD Assessment Challenges	306

11.3	Simple Versus Complex Systems	307
11.4	Strawman MOMs for a Civil-Military Operations Center	314
11.5	Spectrum of Assessment Techniques	315
13.1	EMS Processes and Some of Their Advantages	341
13.2	Missions for DoD over the Next 20 Years	347

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Only editors can know how much help it takes to produce a book like this. The authors, first and foremost, suffered, more or less patiently, through delays and revisions, some of them extensive, in the interest of converting a clutch of good ideas into a relatively coherent volume. Bob Klitgaard, dean of the RAND Graduate School, had the idea for the book and was its sponsor throughout. We received, in RAND fashion, reviews that were both detailed and frank from Ted Harshberger, Tom McNaugher, and Michael O'Hanlon. One of us, Greg Treverton, started as a reviewer but was then challenged to put a contribution where his critique had been. He met the challenge.

We had the good fortune to have Jeri O'Donnell as editor and Janet DeLand doing the final page composition. If important analytic concepts are seen to emerge from complicated prose, that is a tribute to their fine work. Last, but hardly least, Rachel Swanger shepherded the book to final completion with grace and persistence.

To all these good people, we express our appreciation. We also repeat the usual disclaimer that while they can take credit for what is good in these pages, only we and the authors should be held responsible for any gremlins that remain.

ABBREVIATIONS

A&T	Acquisition and Technology
ABAT	Army brilliant antitank
ACAV	air-cushioned amphibious vessel
AFQT	Armed Forces Qualification Test
APOD	airport of debarkation
ASD	Assistant Secretary of Defense
ASVAB	Armed Services Vocational Aptitude Battery
ATACM	Army's Tactical Missile System
AWACS	Airborne Warning and Control System
BAT	brilliant antitank
BCP	best commercial practice
bps	bits per second
BRAC	base realignment and closure
BW	biological weapons
CAIV	cost as an independent variable
CAPE	C4ISR Analytic Performance Evaluation
CBW	chemical and biological weapons
CCD	charge-coupled device
C-Day	day on which U.S. forces begin mobilizing
CD-ROM	compact disk—read-only memory
CEC	cooperative engagement capability
CFATF	Caribbean Financial Action Task Force

CFE	Conventional Forces in Europe
C4	command, control, communications, and computers
C4ISR	command, control, communications, computers, intelligence, surveillance, and reconnaissance
CICA	Competition in Contracting Act
CINC	commander in chief
CMOC	civil-military operations center
COBP	code of best practice
CONOP	concept of operations
CONUS	continental United States
CPO	chief purchasing officer
C3	command, control, and communications
C3I	command, control, communications, and intelligence
C2	command and control
CVBG	carrier battle group
CW	chemical weapons
DAB	Defense Acquisition Board
DCAA	Defense Contract Administration Agency
D-Day	day on which war begins
DEPTEMPO	tempo of deployments
DMSO	Defense Modeling and Simulation Organization
DoD	Department of Defense
DoN	Department of the Navy
DOS	disk operating system
DOTML-PF	doctrine, organization, training, materiel, leadership and education, personnel, and facilities
DP	dimensional parameter
DRB	Defense Resources Board
DRID	Defense Reform Initiative Directive
DSD	Decision Support Department
DVD	digital versatile disk

EELV	Evolved Expendable Launch Vehicle (U.S. Air Force)
EMS	electronic meeting system
EPCRA	Emergency Planning and Community Right-to-Know Act
EU	European Union
FAIR	Federal Activities Inventory Reform
FAR	Federal Acquisition Regulations
FCS	Future Combat System
FEMA	Federal Emergency Management Agency
FinCEN	Financial Crimes Enforcement Network
FY	fiscal year
FYDP	Future Years Defense Program
GCC	Gulf Cooperation Council
GCCS	Global Command and Control System
GCSS	Global Combat Support System
GIG	global information grid
GNP	gross national product
GPS	global positioning system
HLA	High Level Architecture
HPM	high-power microwave
HTML	hypertext markup language
HUMINT	human intelligence
ICBM	intercontinental ballistic missile
IFFN	Identification Friend Foe or Neutral
IPT	integrated process team
IRA	Irish Republican Army
ISO	International Standards Organization
ISR	intelligence, surveillance, and reconnaissance
IW	information warfare
JCS	joint chiefs of staff
JDAM	Joint Direct Attack Munition
JFCOM	Joint Forces Command

JICM	Joint Integrated Contingency Model
JPEG	Joint Photographic Experts Group
JSF	Joint Strike Fighter
JSIMS	Joint Simulation System
JSOW	Joint Standoff Weapon
JSTARS	Joint Surveillance Target Attack Radar System
JVB	Joint Virtual Battlespace
JWARS	Joint Warfare System
km	kilometer
Kt	Kiloton
LAN	local area network
M&S	modeling and simulation
MCES	Modular Command and Control Evaluation Structure
MEMS	micro-electromechanical system
MIT	Massachusetts Institute of Technology
MLRS	multiple-rocket launcher system
MOA	mission oriented approach
MOE	measure of effectiveness
MOFE	measure of force effectiveness
MOM	measure of merit
MOOTW	military operations other than war
MOP	measure of C2 system performance
MORS	Military Operations Research Society
MRM	multiresolution modeling
MRMPM	multiresolution, multiperspective modeling
MTW	major theater war
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NBAT	Naval brilliant antitank
NCO	noncommissioned officer
NGO	nongovernmental organization
NIPRnet	joint Internet for unclassified work

NPS	Naval Postgraduate School
NRL	Naval Research Laboratory
OFW	Objective Force Warrior
OMB	Office of Management and Budget
ONR	Office of Naval Research
OOTW	operations other than war
OPM	Office of Personnel Management
OSD	Office of the Secretary of Defense
PEM	personal-computer model
PGM	precision guided munition
PO	petty officer
POM	program objectives memorandum
PPBS	Planning, Programming, and Budgeting System
PSYOP	psychological operation
QDR	Quadrennial Defense Review
RAM	random access memory
R&D	research and development
RMA	revolution in military affairs
ROTC	Reserve Officers Training Corps
RSTA	reconnaissance, surveillance, targeting, and acquisition
SADARM	sense and destroy armor munition
SALT	Strategic Arms Limitations Treaty
SAM	surface-to-air-missile
SARA	Superfund Amendments and Reauthorization Act
SAS	Studies, Analysis, and Simulations
SBA	Small Business Administration
SBCT	Stryker Brigade Combat Team
SCAV	Sea Cavalry
SEAD	suppression of enemy air defenses
SFW	sensor fused weapon
SINCGARS	Single Channel Ground and Airborne Radio System

SIPRnet	joint Internet for secret material
SIW	strategic information warfare
SLBM	submarine-launched ballistic missile
SOF	special operations force
SPOD	seaport of debarkation
SROC	Senior Readiness Oversight Council
SSC	smaller-scale contingency
SWA	Southwest Asia
TACCFS	Theater Air Command and Control Simulation Facility
TBMD	theater ballistic missile defense
TCO	transcontinental criminal organization
TCP/IP	transmission control protocol/Internet protocol
TDA	table of distribution and allowance
TOC	tactical operations center
TOC	total ownership cost
TOE	table of equipment
TQM	total quality management
TRI	toxic releases inventory
UAV	unmanned aerial vehicle
UCAV	unmanned combat air vehicle
VV&C	verify, validate, and certify
WMD	weapons of mass destruction
XML	extensible markup language