



ARROYO CENTER

A Stated Preference Analysis of the Determinants of Unit and Soldier Operational Effectiveness

Online Appendixes

Craig A. Bond, M. Wade Markel, Olesya Tkacheva,
Richard E. Darilek, Robert G. Fix, Bryan W. Hallmark,
Henry A. Leonard, Duncan Long, Todd Nichols

For more information on this publication, visit www.rand.org/t/RR1745

Published by the RAND Corporation, Santa Monica, Calif.

© Copyright 2019 RAND Corporation

RAND® is a registered trademark.

Limited Print and Electronic Distribution Rights

This document and trademark(s) contained herein are protected by law. This representation of RAND intellectual property is provided for noncommercial use only. Unauthorized posting of this publication online is prohibited. Permission is given to duplicate this document for personal use only, as long as it is unaltered and complete. Permission is required from RAND to reproduce, or reuse in another form, any of its research documents for commercial use. For information on reprint and linking permissions, please visit www.rand.org/pubs/permissions.

The RAND Corporation is a research organization that develops solutions to public policy challenges to help make communities throughout the world safer and more secure, healthier and more prosperous. RAND is nonprofit, nonpartisan, and committed to the public interest.

RAND's publications do not necessarily reflect the opinions of its research clients and sponsors.

Support RAND

Make a tax-deductible charitable contribution at
www.rand.org/giving/contribute

www.rand.org

Survey Instruments

This appendix presents the survey instruments we used to elicit the data on which our findings and recommendations rest. Respondents took one of the following six surveys, depending on the nature of their operational experience:

- Brigade Combat Teams
- Maneuver Battalions
- Engineer Battalions
- Engineer Companies
- Military Police Companies
- Individuals.

Brigade Combat Teams

PART I: Introduction

Your Task: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. The corps has established an effective security presence throughout most of the country, but there are provinces that coalition forces have had to concede to the insurgents because of insufficient coalition forces. You are trying to accumulate forces to launch offensives into these areas.

You will be given three different scenarios. Each scenario presents a thumbnail sketch of the situation in a brigade combat team (BCT) area of operations. Scenarios highlight the human and physical terrain, enemy capabilities and level of activity, and the unit's anticipated mission.

Each scenario consists of five rounds. In each round, you will be asked to choose the most appropriate BCT to perform the mission described in the scenario. Options will differ with respect to several major characteristics, including BCT type, the unit's experience in country, its level of post-mobilization training (if ARNG), and the cost that choosing that particular unit will incur in terms of risk to the commander's overall plan, especially the intention to launch an offensive. Choices will be presented in table format.

Continue

PART II: Mission

You will be given three different scenarios. After each scenario you will be presented with five different tables. At each table you will choose the most appropriate unit for the operational environment and threat level provided in the scenario.

The unit characteristics will be described in a table form as follows:

- *Cost*: The additional risk that selecting a particular option will incur in terms of the commander's overall plan, particularly in terms of impact on the forthcoming offensive.
- *In-Country Experience*: All units are available for your mission for up to 6 months, but they have varying degrees of in-country experience.
- *Post-Mobilization Training*: For all ARNG units, the information about training conducted as a unit to prepare for deployment. It includes training conducted while mobilized under Title 32 authority immediately prior to mobilization under Title 10, as well as training conducted after Title 10 mobilization.
- *Force Structure Component*: Companies will be from either the Army National Guard (ARNG/COMP O2) or Active component (Active/COMP O1).
- *Unit Type*: Units will be either Infantry Brigade Combat Teams (IBCTs) or Heavy Brigade Combat Teams, also known as Armored Brigade Combat Teams (HBCTs).

You will not be able to go back to the previous table. There are no right or wrong answers to the questions. We are interested in your professional judgment.

**Begin
Scenario**

Scenario 1

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing an infantry brigade combat team (IBCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The IBCT's area of operations consists mostly of urban and close terrain, with two medium-sized cities with populations of 300,000 and 500,000.

Threat Level: Insurgent activity is sporadic and of variable intensity. Currently, the J-2 believes that the IBCT's offensives have significantly disrupted the insurgency in the province. Currently, most attacks on coalition forces take the form of IED and rocket attacks, though the enemy continues a campaign of assassination and intimidation against host nation forces.

Incoming Unit Mission: To replace the outgoing IBCT, which has enjoyed significant success in neutralizing the insurgency, and to consolidate the IBCT's success and transition to stability operations, with emphasis on developing host nation security forces and supporting economic development.

For scenario 1, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units. Also assume that all units are available at the time needed for up to 6 months, and are equipped at the same level except as indicated by unit type (HBCT, IBCT).

Table 1	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Cost	<p>No Cost This unit was already scheduled to replace the outgoing BCT. Selecting this particular unit will not increase risk to the commander's plan.</p>	<p>Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.</p>	<p>High Cost This unit is intended to participate in the forthcoming offensive. Selecting this unit to perform the mission described in the scenario means that it will not be available in the forthcoming offensive, which will have to be deferred for several months as a result.</p>
In-Country Experience	<p>None BCTs with no prior in-country experience.</p>	<p>Counterinsurgency BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.</p>	<p>Security BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.</p>
Component	ARNG/COMPO 2	ARNG/COMPO 2	Active/COMPO 1
Post-Mobilization Training	<p>High BCT has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).</p>	<p>Moderate BCT has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).</p>	<p>N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."</p>
Unit Type	HBCT	IBCT	IBCT

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 1: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing an infantry brigade combat team (IBCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The IBCT's area of operations consists mostly of urban and close terrain, with two medium-sized cities with populations of 300,000 and 500,000.

Threat Level: Insurgent activity is sporadic and of variable intensity. Currently, the J-2 believes that the IBCT's offensives have significantly disrupted the insurgency in the province. Currently, most attacks on coalition forces take the form of IED and rocket attacks, though the enemy continues a campaign of assassination and intimidation against host nation forces.

Incoming Unit Mission: To replace the outgoing IBCT, which has enjoyed significant success in neutralizing the insurgency, and to consolidate the IBCT's success and transition to stability operations, with emphasis on developing host nation security forces and supporting economic development.

For scenario 1, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units. Also assume that all units are available at the time needed for up to 6 months, and are equipped at the same level except as indicated by unit type (HBCT, IBCT).

Table 2	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Cost	No Cost This unit was already scheduled to replace the outgoing BCT. Selecting this particular unit will not increase risk to the commander's plan.	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.
In-Country Experience	Counterinsurgency BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	None BCTs with no prior in-country experience.	Security BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.
Component	Active/COMPO 1	ARNG/COMPO 2	ARNG/COMPO 2
Post-Mobilization Training	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."	High BCT has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).	Moderate BCT has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).
Unit Type	HBCT	IBCT	HBCT

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 1: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing an infantry brigade combat team (IBCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The IBCT's area of operations consists mostly of urban and close terrain, with two medium-sized cities with populations of 300,000 and 500,000.

Threat Level: Insurgent activity is sporadic and of variable intensity. Currently, the J-2 believes that the IBCT's offensives have significantly disrupted the insurgency in the province. Currently, most attacks on coalition forces take the form of IED and rocket attacks, though the enemy continues a campaign of assassination and intimidation against host nation forces.

Incoming Unit Mission: To replace the outgoing IBCT, which has enjoyed significant success in neutralizing the insurgency, and to consolidate the IBCT's success and transition to stability operations, with emphasis on developing host nation security forces and supporting economic development.

For scenario 1, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units. Also assume that all units are available at the time needed for up to 6 months, and are equipped at the same level except as indicated by unit type (HBCT, IBCT).

Table 3	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Cost	No Cost This unit was already scheduled to replace the outgoing BCT. Selecting this particular unit will not increase risk to the commander's plan.	High Cost This unit is intended to participate in the forthcoming offensive. Selecting this unit to perform the mission described in the scenario means that it will not be available in the forthcoming offensive, which will have to be deferred for several months as a result.	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.
In-Country Experience	Security BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.	None BCTs with no prior in-country experience.	Counterinsurgency BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.
Component	ARNG/COMPO 2	Active/COMPO 1	ARNG/COMPO 2
Post-Mobilization Training	High BCT has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."	Moderate BCT has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).
Unit Type	IBCT	HBCT	HBCT

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 1: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing an infantry brigade combat team (IBCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The IBCT's area of operations consists mostly of urban and close terrain, with two medium-sized cities with populations of 300,000 and 500,000.

Threat Level: Insurgent activity is sporadic and of variable intensity. Currently, the J-2 believes that the IBCT's offensives have significantly disrupted the insurgency in the province. Currently, most attacks on coalition forces take the form of IED and rocket attacks, though the enemy continues a campaign of assassination and intimidation against host nation forces.

Incoming Unit Mission: To replace the outgoing IBCT, which has enjoyed significant success in neutralizing the insurgency, and to consolidate the IBCT's success and transition to stability operations, with emphasis on developing host nation security forces and supporting economic development.

For scenario 1, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units. Also assume that all units are available at the time needed for up to 6 months, and are equipped at the same level except as indicated by unit type (HBCT, IBCT).

Table 4	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Cost	<p>Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.</p>	<p>No Cost This unit was already scheduled to replace the outgoing BCT. Selecting this particular unit will not increase risk to the commander's plan.</p>	<p>High Cost This unit is intended to participate in the forthcoming offensive. Selecting this unit to perform the mission described in the scenario, means that it will not be available in the forthcoming offensive, which will have to be deferred for several months as a result.</p>
In-Country Experience	<p>Counterinsurgency BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.</p>	<p>None BCTs with no prior in-country experience.</p>	<p>Security BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.</p>
Component	ARNG/COMPO 2	ARNG/COMPO 2	Active/COMPO 1
Post-Mobilization Training	<p>High BCT has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).</p>	<p>Moderate BCT has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).</p>	<p>N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."</p>
Unit Type	HBCT	IBCT	HBCT

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 1: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing an infantry brigade combat team (IBCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The IBCT's area of operations consists mostly of urban and close terrain, with two medium-sized cities with populations of 300,000 and 500,000.

Threat Level: Insurgent activity is sporadic and of variable intensity. Currently, the J-2 believes that the IBCT's offensives have significantly disrupted the insurgency in the province. Currently, most attacks on coalition forces take the form of IED and rocket attacks, though the enemy continues a campaign of assassination and intimidation against host nation forces.

Incoming Unit Mission: To replace the outgoing IBCT, which has enjoyed significant success in neutralizing the insurgency, and to consolidate the IBCT's success and transition to stability operations, with emphasis on developing host nation security forces and supporting economic development.

For scenario 1, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units. Also assume that all units are available at the time needed for up to 6 months, and are equipped at the same level except as indicated by unit type (HBCT, IBCT).

Table 5	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Cost	<p>High Cost This unit is intended to participate in the forthcoming offensive. Selecting this unit to perform the mission described in the scenario means that it will not be available in the forthcoming offensive, which will have to be deferred for several months as a result.</p>	<p>No Cost This unit was already scheduled to replace the outgoing BCT. Selecting this particular unit will not increase risk to the commander's plan.</p>	<p>Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.</p>
In-Country Experience	<p>Counterinsurgency BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.</p>	<p>Security BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.</p>	<p>None BCTs with no prior in-country experience.</p>
Component	Active/COMPO 1	ARNG/COMPO 2	Active/COMPO 1
Post-Mobilization Training	<p>N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."</p>	<p>Moderate BCT has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).</p>	<p>N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."</p>
Unit Type	IBCT	HBCT	HBCT

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 1: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing an infantry brigade combat team (IBCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The IBCT's area of operations consists mostly of urban and close terrain, with two medium-sized cities with populations of 300,000 and 500,000.

Threat Level: Insurgent activity is sporadic and of variable intensity. Currently, the J-2 believes that the IBCT's offensives have significantly disrupted the insurgency in the province. Currently, most attacks on coalition forces take the form of IED and rocket attacks, though the enemy continues a campaign of assassination and intimidation against host nation forces.

Incoming Unit Mission: To replace the outgoing IBCT, which has enjoyed significant success in neutralizing the insurgency, and to consolidate the IBCT's success and transition to stability operations, with emphasis on developing host nation security forces and supporting economic development.

In a couple of sentences, please describe any other unit characteristics that would be important to your decision in this scenario.

Great job!

You have completed the first scenario. You are ready to proceed to scenario 2.

Begin Scenario 2

Scenario 2

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing a heavy brigade combat team (HBCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The area of operations is centered on the provincial capital, a city of about 500,000 inhabitants.

Threat Level: The situation in the brigade area of operations is challenging. Neither the host nation government—supported by coalition forces—nor the insurgents hold sway. The CJ-2 believes that the insurgent headquarters for the province is located in the city. Insurgents mostly employ IEDs with varying degrees of sophistication to attack U.S. troops, but can also conduct attacks by fire and small-scale ambushes. Insurgent forces have seized several checkpoints manned by host nation security forces. According to the CJ-2, insurgent activity and capability in the city has not yet peaked, but is trending upward.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming unit will replace the HBCT that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The new BCT will have the same mission as the outgoing unit: to neutralize the insurgency in the area of operations, with a secondary mission to develop host nation security forces. The current brigade can operate with its assigned armored vehicles, but generally operates either dismounted or in up armored High Mobility Multipurpose Wheeled Vehicle (HMMWVs) and Mine-Resistant Ambush Protected (MRAPs).

For scenario 2, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units. Also assume that all units are available at the time needed for up to 6 months, and are equipped at the same level except as indicated by unit type (HBCT, IBCT).

Table 1	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
In-Country Experience	None BCTs with no prior in-country experience.	Counterinsurgency BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	Security BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.
Component	Active/COMPO1	Active/COMPO1	ARNG/COMPO2
Post-Mobilization Training	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."	Moderate BCT has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs)
Cost	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.	High Cost This unit is intended to participate in the forthcoming offensive. Selecting this unit to perform the mission described in the scenario means that it will not be available in the forthcoming offensive, which will have to be deferred for several months as a result.	No Cost This unit was already scheduled to replace the outgoing BCT. Selecting this particular unit will not increase risk to the commander's plan.
Unit Type	HBCT	IBCT	HBCT

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 2: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing a heavy brigade combat team (HBCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The area of operations is centered on the provincial capital, a city of about 500,000 inhabitants.

Threat Level: The situation in the brigade area of operations is challenging. Neither the host nation government—supported by coalition forces—nor the insurgents hold sway. The CJ-2 believes that the insurgent headquarters for the province is located in the city. Insurgents mostly employ IEDs with varying degrees of sophistication to attack U.S. troops, but can also conduct attacks by fire and small-scale ambushes. Insurgent forces have seized several checkpoints manned by host nation security forces. According to the CJ-2, insurgent activity and capability in the city has not yet peaked, but is trending upward.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming unit will replace the HBCT that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The new BCT will have the same mission as the outgoing unit: to neutralize the insurgency in the area of operations, with a secondary mission to develop host nation security forces. The current brigade can operate with its assigned armored vehicles, but generally operates either dismounted or in up armored High Mobility Multipurpose Wheeled Vehicle (HMMWVs) and Mine-Resistant Ambush Protected (MRAPs).

For scenario 2, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units. Also assume that all units are available at the time needed for up to 6 months, and are equipped at the same level except as indicated by unit type (HBCT, IBCT).

Table 2	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
In-Country Experience	Counterinsurgency BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	None BCTs with no prior in-country experience.	Security BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security
Component	ARNG/COMPO2	Active/COMPO1	ARNG/COMPO2
Post-Mobilization Training	Moderate BCT has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."	High BCT has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).
Cost	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.	High Cost This unit is intended to participate in the forthcoming offensive. Selecting this unit to perform the mission described in the scenario means that it will not be available in the forthcoming offensive, which will have to be deferred for several months as a result.	No Cost This unit was already scheduled to replace the outgoing BCT. Selecting this particular unit will not increase risk to the commander's plan.
Unit Type	HBCT	HBCT	IBCT

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 2: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing a heavy brigade combat team (HBCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The area of operations is centered on the provincial capital, a city of about 500,000 inhabitants.

Threat Level: The situation in the brigade area of operations is challenging. Neither the host nation government—supported by coalition forces—nor the insurgents hold sway. The CJ-2 believes that the insurgent headquarters for the province is located in the city. Insurgents mostly employ IEDs with varying degrees of sophistication to attack U.S. troops, but can also conduct attacks by fire and small-scale ambushes. Insurgent forces have seized several checkpoints manned by host nation security forces. According to the CJ-2, insurgent activity and capability in the city has not yet peaked, but is trending upward.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming unit will replace the HBCT that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The new BCT will have the same mission as the outgoing unit: to neutralize the insurgency in the area of operations, with a secondary mission to develop host nation security forces. The current brigade can operate with its assigned armored vehicles, but generally operates either dismounted or in up armored High Mobility Multipurpose Wheeled Vehicle (HMMWVs) and Mine-Resistant Ambush Protected (MRAPs).

For scenario 2, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units. Also assume that all units are available at the time needed for up to 6 months, and are equipped at the same level except as indicated by unit type (HBCT, IBCT).

Table 3	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
In-Country Experience	Counterinsurgency BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	None BCTs with no prior in-country experience.	Security BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.
Component	ARNG/COMPO2	ARNG/COMPO2	Active/COMPO1
Post-Mobilization Training	High BCT has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).	Moderate BCT has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."
Cost	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.	No Cost This unit was already scheduled to replace the outgoing BCT. Selecting this particular unit will not increase risk to the commander's plan.	High Cost This unit is intended to participate in the forthcoming offensive. Selecting this unit to perform the mission described in the scenario means that it will not be available in the forthcoming offensive, which will have to be deferred for several months as a result.
Unit Type	HBCT	IBCT	HBCT

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 2: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing a heavy brigade combat team (HBCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The area of operations is centered on the provincial capital, a city of about 500,000 inhabitants.

Threat Level: The situation in the brigade area of operations is challenging. Neither the host nation government—supported by coalition forces—nor the insurgents hold sway. The CJ-2 believes that the insurgent headquarters for the province is located in the city. Insurgents mostly employ IEDs with varying degrees of sophistication to attack U.S. troops, but can also conduct attacks by fire and small-scale ambushes. Insurgent forces have seized several checkpoints manned by host nation security forces. According to the CJ-2, insurgent activity and capability in the city has not yet peaked, but is trending upward.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming unit will replace the HBCT that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The new BCT will have the same mission as the outgoing unit: to neutralize the insurgency in the area of operations, with a secondary mission to develop host nation security forces. The current brigade can operate with its assigned armored vehicles, but generally operates either dismounted or in up armored High Mobility Multipurpose Wheeled Vehicle (HMMWVs) and Mine-Resistant Ambush Protected (MRAPs).

For scenario 2, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units. Also assume that all units are available at the time needed for up to 6 months, and are equipped at the same level except as indicated by unit type (HBCT, IBCT).

Table 4	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
In-Country Experience	Security BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security	None BCTs with no prior in-country experience.	Counterinsurgency BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.
Component	ARNG/COMPO2	ARNG/COMPO2	Active/COMPO1
Post-Mobilization Training	Moderate BCT has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).	High BCT has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."
Cost	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.	No Cost This unit was already scheduled to replace the outgoing BCT. Selecting this particular unit will not increase risk to the commander's plan.
Unit Type	HBCT	IBCT	HBCT

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 2: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing a heavy brigade combat team (HBCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The area of operations is centered on the provincial capital, a city of about 500,000 inhabitants.

Threat Level: The situation in the brigade area of operations is challenging. Neither the host nation government—supported by coalition forces—nor the insurgents hold sway. The CJ-2 believes that the insurgent headquarters for the province is located in the city. Insurgents mostly employ IEDs with varying degrees of sophistication to attack U.S. troops, but can also conduct attacks by fire and small-scale ambushes. Insurgent forces have seized several checkpoints manned by host nation security forces. According to the CJ-2, insurgent activity and capability in the city has not yet peaked, but is trending upward.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming unit will replace the HBCT that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The new BCT will have the same mission as the outgoing unit: to neutralize the insurgency in the area of operations, with a secondary mission to develop host nation security forces. The current brigade can operate with its assigned armored vehicles, but generally operates either dismounted or in up armored High Mobility Multipurpose Wheeled Vehicle (HMMWVs) and Mine-Resistant Ambush Protected (MRAPs).

For scenario 2, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units. Also assume that all units are available at the time needed for up to 6 months, and are equipped at the same level except as indicated by unit type (HBCT, IBCT).

Table 5	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
In-Country Experience	None BCTs with no prior in-country experience.	Security BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security	Counterinsurgency BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.
Component	ARNG/COMPO2	Active/COMPO1	ARNG/COMPO2
Post-Mobilization Training	High BCT has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."	Moderate BCT has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).
Cost	No Cost This unit was already scheduled to replace the outgoing BCT. Selecting this particular unit will not increase risk to the commander's plan.	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.
Unit Type	HBCT	IBCT	IBCT

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 2: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing a heavy brigade combat team (HBCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The area of operations is centered on the provincial capital, a city of about 500,000 inhabitants.

Threat Level: The situation in the brigade area of operations is challenging. Neither the host nation government—supported by coalition forces—nor the insurgents hold sway. The CJ-2 believes that the insurgent headquarters for the province is located in the city. Insurgents mostly employ IEDs with varying degrees of sophistication to attack U.S. troops, but can also conduct attacks by fire and small-scale ambushes. Insurgent forces have seized several checkpoints manned by host nation security forces. According to the CJ-2, insurgent activity and capability in the city has not yet peaked, but is trending upward.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming unit will replace the HBCT that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The new BCT will have the same mission as the outgoing unit: to neutralize the insurgency in the area of operations, with a secondary mission to develop host nation security forces. The current brigade can operate with its assigned armored vehicles, but generally operates either dismounted or in up armored High Mobility Multipurpose Wheeled Vehicle (HMMWVs) and Mine-Resistant Ambush Protected (MRAPs).

In a couple of sentences, please describe any other unit characteristics that would be important to your decision in this scenario.

Great job!

You have completed the second scenario. You are ready to proceed to scenario 3.

**Begin
Scenario
3**

Scenario 3

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing a brigade combat team (BCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The area of operations is dominated by insurgents and combines several small to medium-sized communities ranging in size from 25,000 to 100,000 people along major rivers and roads. Those lines of communication eventually trace back to insurgent sanctuaries in other parts of the host nation and neighboring countries. The terrain seems well-suited to either a heavy brigade combat team (HBCT) or a Stryker brigade combat team (SBCT).

Threat Level: The insurgents are capable of attacking U.S. forces with IEDs, rockets and mortars, and coordinated attacks using fire and maneuver. In one attack, a platoon-sized insurgent element conducted a raid on a small U.S. outpost and seized three prisoners, for whom U.S. forces continue to search. Recent insurgent attacks have alienated the local population from the insurgents to a degree, but the population should be considered hostile to what they deem to be the U.S. occupation.

Incoming Unit Mission: Currently, another BCT's reconnaissance, surveillance, and target acquisition (RSTA) squadron operates in the area of operations in order to disrupt insurgent activity and lines of communication. The mission of the incoming U.S. BCT will be to neutralize the insurgency in its area of operations. To do so, it will have to operate in dispersed, small-unit outposts in order to establish a security presence in population centers. At least initially, you anticipate that operating in this pattern will invite attack, so U.S. forces must be proficient and competent. The RSTA squadron currently deployed in the area of operations will rejoin its parent unit.

For scenario 3, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units. Also assume that all units are available at the time needed for up to 6 months, and are equipped at the same level except as indicated by unit type (HBCT, IBCT).

Table 1	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Unit Type	HBCT	HBCT	IBCT
Post-Mobilization Training	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."	Moderate BCT has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).	High BCT has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).
Cost	High Cost This unit is intended to participate in the forthcoming offensive. Selecting this unit to perform the mission described in the scenario means that it will not be available in the forthcoming offensive, which will have to be deferred for several months as a result.	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.	No Cost This unit was already scheduled to replace the outgoing BCT. Selecting this particular unit will not increase risk to the commander's plan.
In-Country Experience	None BCTs with no prior in-country experience.	Counterinsurgency BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	Security BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.
Component	Active/COMPO1	ARNG/COMPO2	ARNG/COMPO2

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 3: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing a brigade combat team (BCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The area of operations is dominated by insurgents and combines several small to medium-sized communities ranging in size from 25,000 to 100,000 people along major rivers and roads. Those lines of communication eventually trace back to insurgent sanctuaries in other parts of the host nation and neighboring countries. The terrain seems well-suited to either a heavy brigade combat team (HBCT) or a Stryker brigade combat team (SBCT).

Threat Level: The insurgents are capable of attacking U.S. forces with IEDs, rockets and mortars, and coordinated attacks using fire and maneuver. In one attack, a platoon-sized insurgent element conducted a raid on a small U.S. outpost and seized three prisoners, for whom U.S. forces continue to search. Recent insurgent attacks have alienated the local population from the insurgents to a degree, but the population should be considered hostile to what they deem to be the U.S. occupation.

Incoming Unit Mission: Currently, another BCT's reconnaissance, surveillance, and target acquisition (RSTA) squadron operates in the area of operations in order to disrupt insurgent activity and lines of communication. The mission of the incoming U.S. BCT will be to neutralize the insurgency in its area of operations. To do so, it will have to operate in dispersed, small-unit outposts in order to establish a security presence in population centers. At least initially, you anticipate that operating in this pattern will invite attack, so U.S. forces must be proficient and competent. The RSTA squadron currently deployed in the area of operations will rejoin its parent unit.

For scenario 3, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units. Also assume that all units are available at the time needed for up to 6 months, and are equipped at the same level except as indicated by unit type (HBCT, IBCT).

Table 2	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Unit Type	IBCT	HBCT	HBCT
Post-Mobilization Training	Moderate BCT has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).	High BCT has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."
Cost	No Cost This unit was already scheduled to replace the outgoing BCT. Selecting this particular unit will not increase risk to the commander's plan.	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.	High Cost This unit is intended to participate in the forthcoming offensive. Selecting this unit to perform the mission described in the scenario means that it will not be available in the forthcoming offensive, which will have to be deferred for several months as a result.
In-Country Experience	None BCTs with no prior in-country experience.	Counterinsurgency BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	Security BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.
Component	ARNG/COMPO2	ARNG/COMPO2	Active/COMPO1

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 3: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing a brigade combat team (BCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The area of operations is dominated by insurgents and combines several small to medium-sized communities ranging in size from 25,000 to 100,000 people along major rivers and roads. Those lines of communication eventually trace back to insurgent sanctuaries in other parts of the host nation and neighboring countries. The terrain seems well-suited to either a heavy brigade combat team (HBCT) or a Stryker brigade combat team (SBCT).

Threat Level: The insurgents are capable of attacking U.S. forces with IEDs, rockets and mortars, and coordinated attacks using fire and maneuver. In one attack, a platoon-sized insurgent element conducted a raid on a small U.S. outpost and seized three prisoners, for whom U.S. forces continue to search. Recent insurgent attacks have alienated the local population from the insurgents to a degree, but the population should be considered hostile to what they deem to be the U.S. occupation.

Incoming Unit Mission: Currently, another BCT's reconnaissance, surveillance, and target acquisition (RSTA) squadron operates in the area of operations in order to disrupt insurgent activity and lines of communication. The mission of the incoming U.S. BCT will be to neutralize the insurgency in its area of operations. To do so, it will have to operate in dispersed, small-unit outposts in order to establish a security presence in population centers. At least initially, you anticipate that operating in this pattern will invite attack, so U.S. forces must be proficient and competent. The RSTA squadron currently deployed in the area of operations will rejoin its parent unit.

For scenario 3, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units. Also assume that all units are available at the time needed for up to 6 months, and are equipped at the same level except as indicated by unit type (HBCT, IBCT).

Table 3	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Unit Type	IBCT	HBCT	HBCT
Post-Mobilization Training	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."	Moderate BCT has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).
Cost	High Cost This unit is intended to participate in the forthcoming offensive. Selecting this unit to perform the mission described in the scenario means that it will not be available in the forthcoming offensive, which will have to be deferred for several months as a result.	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.	No Cost This unit was already scheduled to replace the outgoing BCT. Selecting this particular unit will not increase risk to the commander's plan.
In-Country Experience	Counterinsurgency BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	None BCTs with no prior in-country experience.	Security BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security
Component	Active/COMPO1	Active/COMPO1	ARNG/COMPO2

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 3: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing a brigade combat team (BCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The area of operations is dominated by insurgents and combines several small to medium-sized communities ranging in size from 25,000 to 100,000 people along major rivers and roads. Those lines of communication eventually trace back to insurgent sanctuaries in other parts of the host nation and neighboring countries. The terrain seems well-suited to either a heavy brigade combat team (HBCT) or a Stryker brigade combat team (SBCT).

Threat Level: The insurgents are capable of attacking U.S. forces with IEDs, rockets and mortars, and coordinated attacks using fire and maneuver. In one attack, a platoon-sized insurgent element conducted a raid on a small U.S. outpost and seized three prisoners, for whom U.S. forces continue to search. Recent insurgent attacks have alienated the local population from the insurgents to a degree, but the population should be considered hostile to what they deem to be the U.S. occupation.

Incoming Unit Mission: Currently, another BCT's reconnaissance, surveillance, and target acquisition (RSTA) squadron operates in the area of operations in order to disrupt insurgent activity and lines of communication. The mission of the incoming U.S. BCT will be to neutralize the insurgency in its area of operations. To do so, it will have to operate in dispersed, small-unit outposts in order to establish a security presence in population centers. At least initially, you anticipate that operating in this pattern will invite attack, so U.S. forces must be proficient and competent. The RSTA squadron currently deployed in the area of operations will rejoin its parent unit.

For scenario 3, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units. Also assume that all units are available at the time needed for up to 6 months, and are equipped at the same level except as indicated by unit type (HBCT, IBCT).

Table 4	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Unit Type	HBCT	IBCT	IBCT
Post-Mobilization Training	High BCT has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."	Moderate BCT has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).
Cost	No Cost This unit was already scheduled to replace the outgoing BCT. Selecting this particular unit will not increase risk to the commander's plan.	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower-priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower-priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.
In-Country Experience	None BCTs with no prior in-country experience.	Security BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.	Counterinsurgency BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.
Component	ARNG/COMPO2	Active/COMPO1	ARNG/COMPO2

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 3: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing a brigade combat team (BCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The area of operations is dominated by insurgents and combines several small to medium-sized communities ranging in size from 25,000 to 100,000 people along major rivers and roads. Those lines of communication eventually trace back to insurgent sanctuaries in other parts of the host nation and neighboring countries. The terrain seems well-suited to either a heavy brigade combat team (HBCT) or a Stryker brigade combat team (SBCT).

Threat Level: The insurgents are capable of attacking U.S. forces with IEDs, rockets and mortars, and coordinated attacks using fire and maneuver. In one attack, a platoon-sized insurgent element conducted a raid on a small U.S. outpost and seized three prisoners, for whom U.S. forces continue to search. Recent insurgent attacks have alienated the local population from the insurgents to a degree, but the population should be considered hostile to what they deem to be the U.S. occupation.

Incoming Unit Mission: Currently, another BCT's reconnaissance, surveillance, and target acquisition (RSTA) squadron operates in the area of operations in order to disrupt insurgent activity and lines of communication. The mission of the incoming U.S. BCT will be to neutralize the insurgency in its area of operations. To do so, it will have to operate in dispersed, small-unit outposts in order to establish a security presence in population centers. At least initially, you anticipate that operating in this pattern will invite attack, so U.S. forces must be proficient and competent. The RSTA squadron currently deployed in the area of operations will rejoin its parent unit.

For scenario 3, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units. Also assume that all units are available at the time needed for up to 6 months, and are equipped at the same level except as indicated by unit type (HBCT, IBCT).

Table 5	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Unit Type	IBCT	HBCT	HBCT
Post-Mobilization Training	High BCT has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so training time is "N/A."	Moderate BCT has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).
Cost	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.	No Cost This unit was already scheduled to replace the outgoing BCT. Selecting this particular unit will not increase risk to the commander's plan.	Moderate Cost This unit will have to be diverted from a lower priority mission. It is possible, but not assured, that your forces will be able to mitigate the risks in the mission from which the other unit might be diverted.
In-Country Experience	None BCTs with no prior in-country experience.	Counterinsurgency BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	Security BCTs with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security
Component	ARNG/COMPO2	Active/COMPO1	ARNG/COMPO2

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 3: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the deputy G-3 for a multinational corps conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing a brigade combat team (BCT) that is scheduled to redeploy in two months. The area of operations is dominated by insurgents and combines several small to medium-sized communities ranging in size from 25,000 to 100,000 people along major rivers and roads. Those lines of communication eventually trace back to insurgent sanctuaries in other parts of the host nation and neighboring countries. The terrain seems well-suited to either a heavy brigade combat team (HBCT) or a Stryker brigade combat team (SBCT).

Threat Level: The insurgents are capable of attacking U.S. forces with IEDs, rockets and mortars, and coordinated attacks using fire and maneuver. In one attack, a platoon-sized insurgent element conducted a raid on a small U.S. outpost and seized three prisoners, for whom U.S. forces continue to search. Recent insurgent attacks have alienated the local population from the insurgents to a degree, but the population should be considered hostile to what they deem to be the U.S. occupation.

Incoming Unit Mission: Currently, another BCT's reconnaissance, surveillance, and target acquisition (RSTA) squadron operates in the area of operations in order to disrupt insurgent activity and lines of communication. The mission of the incoming U.S. BCT will be to neutralize the insurgency in its area of operations. To do so, it will have to operate in dispersed, small-unit outposts in order to establish a security presence in population centers. At least initially, you anticipate that operating in this pattern will invite attack, so U.S. forces must be proficient and competent. The RSTA squadron currently deployed in the area of operations will rejoin its parent unit.

In a couple of sentences, please describe any other unit characteristics that would be important to your decision in this scenario.

When considering various BCT units, how important to you are each of the following factors for making your choice?

Feature of Specific Unit	Rating				
	1 Not at all Important	2 Slightly Important	3 Somewhat Important	4 Very Important	5 Extremely Important
Cost	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Component	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Post-Mobilization Training	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
In-Country Experience	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Unit Type (IBCT/ HBCT)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Great job! Thank you very much for taking the survey.

Continue

Maneuver Battalions

PART I: Introduction

Your Task: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. You need to develop a recommendation for replacing a maneuver battalion that is scheduled to redeploy in two months.

You will be given three different scenarios. Each scenario presents a thumbnail sketch of the military situation in a particular area of operations. Scenarios highlight the human and physical terrain, enemy capabilities and level of activity, and the unit's anticipated mission.

Each scenario consists of five rounds. In each round, you will be asked to select one of three units to perform the mission described in the scenario. Options will differ with respect to several major characteristics, including Battalion type, the unit's experience in country, its level of post-mobilization training (if ARNG), and the cost that choosing that particular unit will incur in terms of risk to the mission due to available time in theater. Choices will be presented in table format.

PART II: Unit Attributes

The unit characteristics will be described in a table form as follows:

Force Structure Component: Companies will be from either the Army National Guard (ARNG/COMPO 2) or an Active component (Active/COMPO 1).

Post Mobilization Training: For all ARNG battalions, you will be provided with the information about training conducted as a unit to prepare for deployment. It includes training conducted while mobilized under Title 32 authority immediately prior to mobilization under Title 10, as well as training conducted after Title 10 mobilization.

In-country Experience: Units have varying degrees of in-country experience:

Cost: Cost stems from the fact that although all units are available on a short notice, the duration of their engagement will vary. This difference in availability may constrain your ability to complete the mission:

Battalion Type: For some scenarios, information about unit type will be also provided. Battalion will be either Combined Arms (Heavy) Battalion or an Infantry Battalion.

**Ready to
Begin**

PART III—Mission

You will be given three different scenarios. After each scenario you will be presented with five different tables. At each table you will choose the most appropriate unit for the operational environment and threat level provided in the scenario.

You will not be able to go back to the previous table. There are no right or wrong answers to the questions. We are interested in your professional judgment.

**Begin
Scenario
1**

Scenario 1

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. In one of the cities in your area of operation a U.S. division, employing the theater reserve, recently crushed an insurgent uprising. The operation inflicted heavy losses on the insurgents, but insurgent networks still remain entrenched.

Threat Level: Insurgents are seemingly regaining strength. While their level of military capability remains low, they are exploiting poor governance and lackluster economic conditions to mobilize support from socially and economically disadvantaged elements of the local population. On the other hand, more established elements of society in the city oppose the insurgency. Even in their weakened state, however, insurgent forces overmatch host nation police and security forces.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming battalion will replace the RSTA squadron of the brigade combat team, currently responsible for this city. The BCT is employing its RSTA squadron to provide security in the city, but the unit lacks the manpower and capabilities to also support developing host nation forces and host nation governance. Moreover, the brigade needs the RSTA squadron to interdict enemy lines of communication into and across the province.

For scenario 1, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units, and that all units are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Table 1	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Cost	None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.	High (3 mo. with no replacement for 3 mo) Battalion will have to be restored to the theater reserves within 3 months. No immediate replacement will be available for them, leaving at least a 3-month gap until additional U.S. forces arrive in country.	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.
Post-Mobilization Training	High Battalion has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."	Moderate Battalion has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).
Component	ARNG/COMPO 2	Active/COMPO 1	ARNG/COMPO 2
In-Country Experience	None Battalions with no prior in-country experience.	Counterinsurgency Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	Security Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 1: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. In one of the cities in your area of operation a U.S. division, employing the theater reserve, recently crushed an insurgent uprising. The operation inflicted heavy losses on the insurgents, but insurgent networks still remain entrenched.

Threat Level: Insurgents are seemingly regaining strength. While their level of military capability remains low, they are exploiting poor governance and lackluster economic conditions to mobilize support from socially and economically disadvantaged elements of the local population. On the other hand, more established elements of society in the city oppose the insurgency. Even in their weakened state, however, insurgent forces overmatch host nation police and security forces.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming battalion will replace the RSTA squadron of the brigade combat team, currently responsible for this city. The BCT is employing its RSTA squadron to provide security in the city, but the unit lacks the manpower and capabilities to also support developing host nation forces and host nation governance. Moreover, the brigade needs the RSTA squadron to interdict enemy lines of communication into and across the province.

For scenario 1, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units, and that all units are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Table 2	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Cost	None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.	None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.
Post-Mobilization Training	Moderate Battalion has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."	High Battalion has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).
Component	ARNG/COMPO 2	Active/COMPO 1	ARNG/COMPO 2
In-Country Experience	Security Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.	None Battalions with no prior in-country experience.	Counterinsurgency Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 1: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. In one of the cities in your area of operation a U.S. division, employing the theater reserve, recently crushed an insurgent uprising. The operation inflicted heavy losses on the insurgents, but insurgent networks still remain entrenched.

Threat Level: Insurgents are seemingly regaining strength. While their level of military capability remains low, they are exploiting poor governance and lackluster economic conditions to mobilize support from socially and economically disadvantaged elements of the local population. On the other hand, more established elements of society in the city oppose the insurgency. Even in their weakened state, however, insurgent forces overmatch host nation police and security forces.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming battalion will replace the RSTA squadron of the brigade combat team, currently responsible for this city. The BCT is employing its RSTA squadron to provide security in the city, but the unit lacks the manpower and capabilities to also support developing host nation forces and host nation governance. Moreover, the brigade needs the RSTA squadron to interdict enemy lines of communication into and across the province.

For scenario 1, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units, and that all units are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Table 3	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Cost	None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.	High (3 mo. with no replacement for 3 mo) Battalion will have to be restored to the theater reserves within 3 months. No immediate replacement will be available for them, leaving at least a 3-month gap until additional U.S. forces arrive in country.
Post-Mobilization Training	Moderate Battalion has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."
Component	ARNG/COMPO 2	Active/COMPO 1	Active/COMPO 1
In-Country Experience	None Battalions with no prior in-country experience.	Counterinsurgency Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	Security Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 1: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. In one of the cities in your area of operation a U.S. division, employing the theater reserve, recently crushed an insurgent uprising. The operation inflicted heavy losses on the insurgents, but insurgent networks still remain entrenched.

Threat Level: Insurgents are seemingly regaining strength. While their level of military capability remains low, they are exploiting poor governance and lackluster economic conditions to mobilize support from socially and economically disadvantaged elements of the local population. On the other hand, more established elements of society in the city oppose the insurgency. Even in their weakened state, however, insurgent forces overmatch host nation police and security forces.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming battalion will replace the RSTA squadron of the brigade combat team, currently responsible for this city. The BCT is employing its RSTA squadron to provide security in the city, but the unit lacks the manpower and capabilities to also support developing host nation forces and host nation governance. Moreover, the brigade needs the RSTA squadron to interdict enemy lines of communication into and across the province.

For scenario 1, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units, and that all units are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Table 4	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Cost	<p>High (3 mo. with no replacement for 3 mo) Battalion will have to be restored to the theater reserves within 3 months. No immediate replacement will be available for them, leaving at least a 3-month gap until additional U.S. forces arrive in country.</p>	<p>Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.</p>	<p>None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.</p>
Post-Mobilization Training	<p>N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."</p>	<p>High Battalion has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).</p>	<p>Moderate Battalion has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).</p>
Component	Active/COMPO 1	ARNG/COMPO 2	ARNG/COMPO 2
In-Country Experience	<p>None Battalions with no prior in-country experience.</p>	<p>Security Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.</p>	<p>Counterinsurgency Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.</p>

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 1: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. In one of the cities in your area of operation a U.S. division, employing the theater reserve, recently crushed an insurgent uprising. The operation inflicted heavy losses on the insurgents, but insurgent networks still remain entrenched.

Threat Level: Insurgents are seemingly regaining strength. While their level of military capability remains low, they are exploiting poor governance and lackluster economic conditions to mobilize support from socially and economically disadvantaged elements of the local population. On the other hand, more established elements of society in the city oppose the insurgency. Even in their weakened state, however, insurgent forces overmatch host nation police and security forces.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming battalion will replace the RSTA squadron of the brigade combat team, currently responsible for this city. The BCT is employing its RSTA squadron to provide security in the city, but the unit lacks the manpower and capabilities to also support developing host nation forces and host nation governance. Moreover, the brigade needs the RSTA squadron to interdict enemy lines of communication into and across the province.

For scenario 1, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units, and that all units are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Table 5	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Cost	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.	None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.
Post-Mobilization Training	High Battalion has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).	Moderate Battalion has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."
Component	ARNG/COMPO 2	ARNG/COMPO 2	Active/COMPO 1
In-Country Experience	Counterinsurgency Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	None Battalions with no prior in-country experience.	Security Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 1: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. In one of the cities in your area of operation a U.S. division, employing the theater reserve, recently crushed an insurgent uprising. The operation inflicted heavy losses on the insurgents, but insurgent networks still remain entrenched.

Threat Level: Insurgents are seemingly regaining strength. While their level of military capability remains low, they are exploiting poor governance and lackluster economic conditions to mobilize support from socially and economically disadvantaged elements of the local population. On the other hand, more established elements of society in the city oppose the insurgency. Even in their weakened state, however, insurgent forces overmatch host nation police and security forces.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming battalion will replace the RSTA squadron of the brigade combat team, currently responsible for this city. The BCT is employing its RSTA squadron to provide security in the city, but the unit lacks the manpower and capabilities to also support developing host nation forces and host nation governance. Moreover, the brigade needs the RSTA squadron to interdict enemy lines of communication into and across the province.

In a couple of sentences, please describe any other unit characteristics that would be important to your decision in this scenario.

Great job!

You have completed the first scenario. You are ready to proceed to scenario 2.

**Begin
Scenario
2**

Scenario 2

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. Several provinces in your area of operation are currently under a post-conflict reconstruction. In one of the provinces, the insurgency has gained enough strength that operations of the resident provincial reconstruction team (PRT) and agri-business development team have become high risk.

Threat Level: The insurgents mostly employ IEDs, but are capable of conducting squad and platoon size ambushes of limited effectiveness more or less concurrently at different locations in the province.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming maneuver battalion will provide support to governance and the development of host nation security forces. The division commander feels that these are the most important priorities.

For scenario 2, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units, and that all units are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Table 1	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
In-Country Experience	Security Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.	Counterinsurgency Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	None Battalions with no prior in-country experience.
Component	Active/COMPO 1	ARNG/COMPO 2	ARNG/COMPO 2
Post-Mobilization Training	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."	High Battalion has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).	Moderate Battalion has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).
Cost	None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 2: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. Several provinces in your area of operation are currently under a post-conflict reconstruction. In one of the provinces, the insurgency has gained enough strength that operations of the resident provincial reconstruction team (PRT) and agri-business development team have become high risk.

Threat Level: The insurgents mostly employ IEDs, but are capable of conducting squad and platoon size ambushes of limited effectiveness more or less concurrently at different locations in the province.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming maneuver battalion will provide support to governance and the development of host nation security forces. The division commander feels that these are the most important priorities.

For scenario 2, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units, and that all units are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Table 2	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
In-Country Experience	None Battalions with no prior in-country experience.	Counterinsurgency Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	Security Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.
Component	ARNG/COMPO 2	Active/COMPO 1	Active/COMPO 1
Post-Mobilization Training	Moderate Battalion has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."
Cost	None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.	High (3 mo. with no replacement for 3 mo) Battalion will have to be restored to the theater reserves within 3 months. No immediate replacement will be available for them, leaving at least a 3-month gap until additional U.S. forces arrive in country.

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 2: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. Several provinces in your area of operation are currently under a post-conflict reconstruction. In one of the provinces, the insurgency has gained enough strength that operations of the resident provincial reconstruction team (PRT) and agri-business development team have become high risk.

Threat Level: The insurgents mostly employ IEDs, but are capable of conducting squad and platoon size ambushes of limited effectiveness more or less concurrently at different locations in the province.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming maneuver battalion will provide support to governance and the development of host nation security forces. The division commander feels that these are the most important priorities.

For scenario 2, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units, and that all units are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Table 3	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
In-Country Experience	Security Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.	None Battalions with no prior in-country experience.	Counterinsurgency Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.
Component	ARNG/COMPO 2	Active/COMPO 1	ARNG/COMPO 2
Post-Mobilization Training	Moderate Battalion has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."	High Battalion has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).
Cost	None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.	None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 2: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. Several provinces in your area of operation are currently under a post-conflict reconstruction. In one of the provinces, the insurgency has gained enough strength that operations of the resident provincial reconstruction team (PRT) and agri-business development team have become high risk.

Threat Level: The insurgents mostly employ IEDs, but are capable of conducting squad and platoon size ambushes of limited effectiveness more or less concurrently at different locations in the province.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming maneuver battalion will provide support to governance and the development of host nation security forces. The division commander feels that these are the most important priorities.

For scenario 2, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units, and that all units are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Table 4	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
In-Country Experience	Counterinsurgency Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	Security Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.	None Battalions with no prior in-country experience.
Component	Active/COMPO 1	ARNG/COMPO 2	ARNG/COMPO 2
Post-Mobilization Training	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."	Moderate Battalion has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).	High Battalion has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).
Cost	High (3 mo. with no replacement for 3 mo) Battalion will have to be restored to the theater reserves within 3 months. No immediate replacement will be available for them, leaving at least a 3-month gap until additional U.S. forces arrive in country.	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.	None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 2: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. Several provinces in your area of operation are currently under a post-conflict reconstruction. In one of the provinces, the insurgency has gained enough strength that operations of the resident provincial reconstruction team (PRT) and agri-business development team have become high risk.

Threat Level: The insurgents mostly employ IEDs, but are capable of conducting squad and platoon size ambushes of limited effectiveness more or less concurrently at different locations in the province.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming maneuver battalion will provide support to governance and the development of host nation security forces. The division commander feels that these are the most important priorities.

For scenario 2, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units, and that all units are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Table 5	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
In-Country Experience	Counterinsurgency Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	Security Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.	None Battalions with no prior in-country experience.
Component	ARNG/COMPO 2	ARNG/COMPO 2	Active/COMPO 1
Post-Mobilization Training	Moderate Battalion has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).	High Battalion has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."
Cost	None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.	High (3 mo. with no replacement for 3 mo) Battalion will have to be restored to the theater reserves within 3 months. No immediate replacement will be available for them, leaving at least a 3-month gap until additional U.S. forces arrive in country.

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 2: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. Several provinces in your area of operation are currently under a post-conflict reconstruction. In one of the provinces, the insurgency has gained enough strength that operations of the resident provincial reconstruction team (PRT) and agri-business development team have become high risk.

Threat Level: The insurgents mostly employ IEDs, but are capable of conducting squad and platoon size ambushes of limited effectiveness more or less concurrently at different locations in the province.

Incoming Unit Mission: The incoming maneuver battalion will provide support to governance and the development of host nation security forces. The division commander feels that these are the most important priorities.

In a couple of sentences, please describe any other unit characteristics that would be important to your decision in this scenario.

Great job!

You have completed the second scenario. You are ready to proceed to scenario 3.

**Begin
Scenario
3**

Scenario 3

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. An uprising has broken out in a city in one of your subordinate BCT's area of operations. Insurgents have seized control of the central city, including government offices and holy sites with national significance.

Threat Level: The enemy has proven capable of squad-sized maneuver and defense in urban terrain. He has employed both rocket-propelled grenades and explosively formed penetrators (EFPs) effectively.

Incoming Unit Mission: The brigade initially attempted to retake the city with an attached Stryker battalion, but the battalion took heavy losses. You need to reinforce the brigade with an additional maneuver battalion to enable it to resume the offensive. The incoming battalion will assist you with this task.

For scenario 3, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units, and that all units are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Table 1	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Battalion Type	Combined Arms (Heavy)	Combined Arms (Heavy)	Infantry
Post-Mobilization Training	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."	Moderate Battalion has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).	High Battalion has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).
Component	Active/COMPO 1	ARNG/COMPO 2	ARNG/COMPO 2
In-Country Experience	None Battalions with no prior in-country experience.	Counterinsurgency Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	Security Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.
Cost	High (3 mo. with no replacement for 3 mo) Battalion will have to be restored to the theater reserves within 3 months. No immediate replacement will be available for them, leaving at least a 3-month gap until additional U.S. forces arrive in country.	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.	None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 3: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. An uprising has broken out in a city in one of your subordinate BCT's area of operations. Insurgents have seized control of the central city, including government offices and holy sites with national significance.

Threat Level: The enemy has proven capable of squad-sized maneuver and defense in urban terrain. He has employed both rocket-propelled grenades and explosively formed penetrators (EFPs) effectively.

Incoming Unit Mission: The brigade initially attempted to retake the city with an attached Stryker battalion, but the battalion took heavy losses. You need to reinforce the brigade with an additional maneuver battalion to enable it to resume the offensive. The incoming battalion will assist you with this task.

For scenario 3, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units, and that all units are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Table 2	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Battalion Type	Combined Arms (Heavy)	Combined Arms (Heavy)	Infantry
Post-Mobilization Training	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."	Moderate Battalion has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."
Component	Active/COMPO 1	ARNG/COMPO 2	Active/COMPO 1
In-Country Experience	None Battalions with no prior in-country experience.	Security Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.	Counterinsurgency Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.
Cost	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.	None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.	High (3 mo. with no replacement for 3 mo) Battalion will have to be restored to the theater reserves within 3 months. No immediate replacement will be available for them, leaving at least a 3-month gap until additional U.S. forces arrive in country.

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 3: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. An uprising has broken out in a city in one of your subordinate BCT's area of operations. Insurgents have seized control of the central city, including government offices and holy sites with national significance.

Threat Level: The enemy has proven capable of squad-sized maneuver and defense in urban terrain. He has employed both rocket-propelled grenades and explosively formed penetrators (EFPs) effectively.

Incoming Unit Mission: The brigade initially attempted to retake the city with an attached Stryker battalion, but the battalion took heavy losses. You need to reinforce the brigade with an additional maneuver battalion to enable it to resume the offensive. The incoming battalion will assist you with this task.

For scenario 3, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units, and that all units are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Table 3	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Battalion Type	Combined Arms (Heavy)	Infantry	Infantry
Post-Mobilization Training	High Battalion has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."	Moderate Battalion has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).
Component	ARNG/COMPO 2	Active/COMPO 1	ARNG/COMPO 2
In-Country Experience	None Battalions with no prior in-country experience.	Security Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.	Counterinsurgency Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.
Cost	None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 3: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. An uprising has broken out in a city in one of your subordinate BCT's area of operations. Insurgents have seized control of the central city, including government offices and holy sites with national significance.

Threat Level: The enemy has proven capable of squad-sized maneuver and defense in urban terrain. He has employed both rocket-propelled grenades and explosively formed penetrators (EFPs) effectively.

Incoming Unit Mission: The brigade initially attempted to retake the city with an attached Stryker battalion, but the battalion took heavy losses. You need to reinforce the brigade with an additional maneuver battalion to enable it to resume the offensive. The incoming battalion will assist you with this task.

For scenario 3, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units, and that all units are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Table 4	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Battalion Type	Combined Arms (Heavy)	Combined Arms (Heavy)	Infantry
Post-Mobilization Training	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."	High Battalion has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).	Moderate Battalion has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).
Component	Active/COMPO 1	ARNG/COMPO 2	ARNG/COMPO 2
In-Country Experience	Security Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.	Counterinsurgency Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.	None Battalions with no prior in-country experience.
Cost	High (3 mo. with no replacement for 3 mo) Battalion will have to be restored to the theater reserves within 3 months. No immediate replacement will be available for them, leaving at least a 3-month gap until additional U.S. forces arrive in country.	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.	None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 3: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. An uprising has broken out in a city in one of your subordinate BCT's area of operations. Insurgents have seized control of the central city, including government offices and holy sites with national significance.

Threat Level: The enemy has proven capable of squad-sized maneuver and defense in urban terrain. He has employed both rocket-propelled grenades and explosively formed penetrators (EFPs) effectively.

Incoming Unit Mission: The brigade initially attempted to retake the city with an attached Stryker battalion, but the battalion took heavy losses. You need to reinforce the brigade with an additional maneuver battalion to enable it to resume the offensive. The incoming battalion will assist you with this task.

For scenario 3, if you had only these units to choose from, which would you select? Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units, and that all units are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Table 5	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Battalion Type	Combined Arms (Heavy)	Infantry	Combined Arms (Heavy)
Post-Mobilization Training	Moderate Battalion has completed 3 months of post-mobilization training prior to arriving to the theater. In recent overseas contingency operations, three months of training was considered sufficient to prepare units for security operations conducted away from Forward Operating Bases (FOBs).	High Battalion has completed 6 months of post-mobilization training, culminating in a Mission Rehearsal Exercise (MRE) at a combat training center (CTC).	N/A Active component units will have completed more than nine months of training as a unit, so active component units' training time is "N/A."
Component	ARNG/COMPO 2	ARNG/COMPO 2	Active/COMPO 1
In-Country Experience	Security Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience providing installation and route security.	None Battalions with no prior in-country experience.	Counterinsurgency Battalions with 3 months of in-country experience conducting counterinsurgency operations.
Cost	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.	Moderate (6 mo. with immediate replacement) Battalion will be available for 6 months and can be immediately replaced from the U.S. forces scheduled to arrive in theater at that time.	None (Available until relieved) Battalion will be able to remain in the area of operations until relieved by another U.S. maneuver battalion (> 9 months), or until the decision is made to transition responsibility for security to host-nation security forces.

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario 3: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the G-3 for a U.S. division conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing nation. An uprising has broken out in a city in one of your subordinate BCT's area of operations. Insurgents have seized control of the central city, including government offices and holy sites with national significance.

Threat Level: The enemy has proven capable of squad-sized maneuver and defense in urban terrain. He has employed both rocket-propelled grenades and explosively formed penetrators (EFPs) effectively.

Incoming Unit Mission: The brigade initially attempted to retake the city with an attached Stryker battalion, but the battalion took heavy losses. You need to reinforce the brigade with an additional maneuver battalion to enable it to resume the offensive. The incoming battalion will assist you with this task.

In a couple of sentences, please describe any other unit characteristics that would be important to your decision in this scenario.

When considering various units, how important to you are each of the following factors for making your choice?

Feature of Specific Unit	Rating				
	1 Not at all Important	2 Slightly Important	3 Somewhat Important	4 Very Important	5 Extremely Important
Cost	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Component	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Post-Mobilization Training	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
In-Country Experience	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Engineer Battalions

Part I: Introduction

Your Task: You are the commander of an engineer brigade supporting an international coalition conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing country. One of your subordinate engineer battalion headquarters is due to rotate back to the United States in two months. Your task is to recommend a replacement unit.

You will be given one scenario with five rounds. In each round, you will be asked to select one of three possible battalion headquarters to replace the outgoing engineer battalion headquarters. The options for the incoming battalion headquarters will differ with respect to several major characteristics, including perceived command and control capability, observable operational experience, unit type, and costs in terms of risk to the Allied mission. Choices will be presented in table format.

Continue

PartART II: Battalion Headquarters Attributes

The characteristics of the battalion headquarters will be described in a table form as follows.

C2 Capability: Battalion commanders and staffs will vary in their capability to command and control engineer operations. Values represent a notional assessment made by you in consultation with trusted subordinates (e.g., command sergeant major) of the battalion headquarters’ capability to command and control operations. You will have formed these assessments based on site visits to these battalion headquarters’ training sites as you prepared for deployment. The three levels of confidence are:

- **Low confidence**: You doubt the ability of the battalion commander and staff to command and control demanding combat operations.
- **Moderate confidence**: You feel that the battalion commander and staff are adequate to perform their anticipated mission. You are uncertain about their ability to cope with unexpected increases in the threat level or changes to enemy tactics.
- **High confidence**: You feel that the battalion commander and staff are capable of providing command and control to subordinate units’ engineer operations under any conceivable circumstances in your area of operations.

C2 Capability	High confidence	Low confidence	Moderate Confidence
----------------------	-----------------	----------------	---------------------

Cost: A battalion headquarters selected for your mission cannot be employed anywhere else in theater. This creates costs to the Allied mission in terms of potentially increased risk. Cost levels are defined as:

- **None—Just deployed**: This is an incoming battalion headquarters scheduled to replace the outgoing battalion.
- **Moderate—Battalion headquarters is being re-missioned from a quiet sector**: The battalion headquarters is currently supporting 2 brigades in a quiet sector controlled by the Allied forces and would be reassigned from here to your mission. While diverting this battalion headquarters would increase friction, it would not significantly increase risk in the allied unit’s area of operations.
- **High—Battalion headquarters is being re-missioned from an active sector**: The battalion headquarters is currently supporting 3 brigades in a strategically important sector in active area of operations and would be reassigned from here to your mission. Diverting this battalion headquarters would incur a significant increase in risk in that area of operations.

Cost	High: re-missioned from active sector	None: just deployed	Moderate: re-missioned from quiet sector
-------------	---------------------------------------	---------------------	--

Effectiveness: Battalions will have different levels of observable operational experience in theater:

- **Satisfactory performance in post-mobilization training, no experience in theater:** The battalion headquarters' performance in post-mobilization route clearance training was satisfactory, but there is no additional information.
- **Demonstrated effectiveness in theater:** Indicates good performance in their current role.

Effectiveness	Demonstrated effectiveness in theater	Satisfactory performance in post-mob training, no experience in theater
----------------------	---------------------------------------	---

Force Structure Component: Battalion headquarters will be from either:

- **USAR/COMPO3:** U.S. Army Reserve
- **Active/COMPO1:** Active component

Component	USAR/COMPO3	Active/COMPO1
------------------	-------------	---------------

Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between battalion headquarters, and that all battalion headquarters are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Ready to Begin

Part III: Mission

You will be given one scenario. For the scenario you will be presented with a series of five tables describing battalion headquarters with differing characteristics. At each table you will be asked to choose the most appropriate battalion headquarters for the operational environment and threat level provided in the scenario.

You will not be able to go back to the previous table. There are no right or wrong answers to the question. We are interested in your professional judgment.

**Begin Engineer
Battalion
Scenario**

Battalion Scenario

Operational Environment: You are the commander of an engineer brigade supporting an international coalition conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing country. Enemy activity has declined significantly in this region following aggressive clearing operations by the supported BCTs. The supported BCTs will be consolidating their gains, and demand for construction support will probably increase, especially in support of host nation security forces.

Threat Level: Direct fire enemy contact is infrequent. The enemy prefers to engage using IEDs, of which about half are command-wire detonated.

Incoming Battalion Headquarters Mission: The battalion headquarters will replace one engineer battalion headquarters which is due to rotate back to the United States in two months. The battalion headquarters will provide command and control over three route clearance companies, two of which are active component, and three construction companies, all of which are reserve component.

For the Battalion Headquarters scenario, if you had only these battalion headquarters to choose from, which would you select?

Table 1	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
C2 Capability	High confidence	High confidence	Moderate confidence
Component	USAR/COMPO3	Active/COMPO1	USAR/COMPO3
Cost	Moderate: re-missioned from quiet sector	None: just deployed	None: just deployed
Effectiveness	Demonstrated effectiveness in theater	Satisfactory performance in post-mob training, no experience in theater	Demonstrated effectiveness in theater

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Battalion Scenario: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the commander of an engineer brigade supporting an international coalition conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing country. Enemy activity has declined significantly in this region following aggressive clearing operations by the supported BCTs. The supported BCTs will be consolidating their gains, and demand for construction support will probably increase, especially in support of host nation security forces.

Threat Level: Direct fire enemy contact is infrequent. The enemy prefers to engage using IEDs, of which about half are command-wire detonated.

Incoming Battalion Headquarters Mission: The battalion headquarters will replace one engineer battalion headquarters which is due to rotate back to the United States in two months. The battalion headquarters will provide command and control over three route clearance companies, two of which are active component, and three construction companies, all of which are reserve component.

For the Battalion Headquarters, scenario, if you had only these battalion headquarters to choose from, which would you select?

Table 2	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
C2 Capability	Moderate confidence	Low confidence	High confidence
Component	Active/COMPO1	Active/COMPO1	USAR/COMPO3
Cost	High: re-missioned from active sector	None: just deployed	Moderate: re-missioned from quiet sector
Effectiveness	Demonstrated effectiveness in theater	Satisfactory performance in post-mob training, no experience in theater	Demonstrated effectiveness in theater

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Battalion Scenario: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the commander of an engineer brigade supporting an international coalition conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing country. Enemy activity has declined significantly in this region following aggressive clearing operations by the supported BCTs. The supported BCTs will be consolidating their gains, and demand for construction support will probably increase, especially in support of host nation security forces.

Threat Level: Direct fire enemy contact is infrequent. The enemy prefers to engage using IEDs, of which about half are command-wire detonated.

Incoming Battalion Headquarters Mission: The battalion headquarters will replace one engineer battalion headquarters which is due to rotate back to the United States in two months. The battalion headquarters will provide command and control over three route clearance companies, two of which are active component, and three construction companies, all of which are reserve component.

For the Battalion Headquarters, scenario, if you had only these battalion headquarters to choose from, which would you select?

Table 3	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
C2 Capability	Moderate confidence	High confidence	Low confidence
Component	USAR/COMPO3	Active/COMPO1	Active/COMPO1
Cost	None: just deployed	High: re-missioned from active sector	None: just deployed
Effectiveness	Satisfactory performance in post-mob training, no experience in theater	Demonstrated effectiveness in theater	Satisfactory performance in post-mob training, no experience in theater

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Battalion Scenario: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the commander of an engineer brigade supporting an international coalition conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing country. Enemy activity has declined significantly in this region following aggressive clearing operations by the supported BCTs. The supported BCTs will be consolidating their gains, and demand for construction support will probably increase, especially in support of host nation security forces.

Threat Level: Direct fire enemy contact is infrequent. The enemy prefers to engage using IEDs, of which about half are command-wire detonated.

Incoming Battalion Headquarters Mission: The battalion headquarters will replace one engineer battalion headquarters which is due to rotate back to the United States in two months. The battalion headquarters will provide command and control over three route clearance companies, two of which are active component, and three construction companies, all of which are reserve component.

For the Battalion Headquarters, scenario, if you had only these battalion headquarters to choose from, which would you select?

Table 4	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
C2 Capability	Moderate confidence	High confidence	High confidence
Component	Active/COMPO1	Active/COMPO1	USAR/COMPO3
Cost	None: just deployed	High: re-missioned from active sector	None: just deployed
Effectiveness	Satisfactory performance in post-mob training, no experience in theater	Demonstrated effectiveness in theater	Demonstrated effectiveness in theater

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Battalion Scenario: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the commander of an engineer brigade supporting an international coalition conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing country. Enemy activity has declined significantly in this region following aggressive clearing operations by the supported BCTs. The supported BCTs will be consolidating their gains, and demand for construction support will probably increase, especially in support of host nation security forces.

Threat Level: Direct fire enemy contact is infrequent. The enemy prefers to engage using IEDs, of which about half are command-wire detonated.

Incoming Battalion Headquarters Mission: The battalion headquarters will replace one engineer battalion headquarters which is due to rotate back to the United States in two months. The battalion headquarters will provide command and control over three route clearance companies, two of which are active component, and three construction companies, all of which are reserve component.

For the Battalion Headquarters, scenario, if you had only these battalion headquarters to choose from, which would you select?

Table 5	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
C2 Capability	Moderate confidence	High confidence	High confidence
Component	Active/COMPO1	USAR/COMPO3	USAR/COMPO3
Cost	Moderate: re-missioned from a quiet sector	None: just deployed	High: re-missioned from active sector
Effectiveness	Demonstrated effectiveness in theater	Satisfactory performance in post-mob training, no experience in theater	Demonstrated effectiveness in theater

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Battalion Scenario: Scenario is unchanged; options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the commander of an engineer brigade supporting an international coalition conducting counterinsurgency operations in a developing country. Enemy activity has declined significantly in this region following aggressive clearing operations by the supported BCTs. The supported BCTs will be consolidating their gains, and demand for construction support will probably increase, especially in support of host nation security forces.

Threat Level: Direct fire enemy contact is infrequent. The enemy prefers to engage using IEDs, of which about half are command-wire detonated.

Incoming Battalion Headquarters Mission: The battalion headquarters will replace one engineer battalion headquarters which is due to rotate back to the United States in two months. The battalion headquarters will provide command and control over three route clearance companies, two of which are active component, and three construction companies, all of which are reserve component.

In a couple of sentences, please describe any other battalion headquarters characteristics that would be important to your decision.

When considering various battalion headquarters, how important to you are each of the following factors for making your choice?

Feature of Specific Battalion	Rating				
	1	2	3	4	5
	Not at all Important	Slightly Important	Somewhat Important	Very Important	Extremely Important
Cost	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Effectiveness	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Component	<input type="checkbox"/>				
C2 Capability	<input type="checkbox"/>				

Great job!

You have completed the Engineer Battalion Headquarters scenario. You are ready to proceed to the Engineer Company scenario.

Begin Engineer Company Scenario

Engineer Companies

Your Task: You are the operations officer for an engineer brigade supporting an international coalition engaged in ongoing counterinsurgency operations in a developing country. One of your subordinate route clearance companies is scheduled to redeploy within the next two months. You must develop a recommendation for your brigade commander on which potential route clearance company should be used to replace the outgoing route clearance company. All companies are available for your mission for at least 6 months.

You will be given one scenario. For this scenario you will be presented with a series of five tables describing companies with differing characteristics. At each table you will choose the most appropriate company for the given operational environment and threat level.

Continue

Cost: A company selected for your mission cannot be employed anywhere else in theater. This creates costs to the Allied mission in terms of potentially increased risk. Cost levels are defined as:

- **None—just deployed:** This is an incoming company scheduled to replace the outgoing company.
- **Moderate:** The company in question will be re-missioned from a quiet sector, in which it was supporting an allied brigade. While diverting this company would increase friction, it would not significantly increase risk in the allied unit’s area of operations.
- **High:** This company is currently supporting another BCT in a strategically important area of operations in which enemy threat levels are fairly high. Diverting this company would incur a significant increase in risk in that area of operations.

Cost	High: re-missioned from active sector	None: just deployed	Moderate: re-missioned from quiet sector
-------------	---------------------------------------	---------------------	--

Manning level: Manning level is based on requirements for conducting route clearance in areas with command wire-detonated IEDs; higher levels of manning increase the company’s ability to conduct dismounted operations to locate and disrupt the individual or unit that is overwatching the IED:

- **Low, 26–30 members:** Platoon average is 26–30 members
- **Acceptable, 31–35 members:** Platoon average is 31–35 members
- **Optimal, 36–40 members:** Platoon average is 36–40 members

Manning level	Low 26–30 members	Acceptable 31–35 members	Optimal 36–40 members
----------------------	----------------------	-----------------------------	--------------------------

Component: Companies will be from either:

- **USAR/COMPO3:** U.S. Army Reserve
- **Active/COMPO1:** Active component

Component	USAR/COMPO3	Active/COMPO1
------------------	-------------	---------------

In-country Experience: This variable indicates the amount of experience in country possessed by each option.

- **Low** indicates that a company **has not** completed validation and has been in the country for **two weeks** or less
- **Medium** indicates that a company **has** completed validation and has been in the country for **about one month**
- **High** indicates that a company **has** completed validation and has been in the country for **3 months**

In-country Experience	Low: < 2 weeks	Medium: ~ 1 month	High: 3 months
-----------------------	----------------	-------------------	----------------

Certification: Reflects the ratio of assigned personnel qualified to operate key mine clearance systems to the number of personnel required to operate them on any given day.

- **Above average** indicates **>250 percent**
- **Below average** indicates **<150 percent**

Certification	Above average >250%	Below average <150%
---------------	------------------------	------------------------

Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between companies, and that all companies are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Ready to Begin

Part V: Mission

You will be given one scenario. For the scenario you will be presented with a series of 5 tables describing U.S. engineer companies with differing characteristics. In each table you will be asked to choose the company that is the most appropriate one for the given operational environment and threat level.

You will not be able to go back to the previous table. There are no right or wrong answers to the questions. We are interested in your professional judgment.

**Begin Engineer
Company
Scenario**

Company Scenario

Operational Environment: You are the operations officer for an engineer brigade supporting an international coalition engaged in ongoing counterinsurgency operations in a developing country. The insurgent presence is more pervasive than originally anticipated. The enemy's primary mode of engagement is emplacing improvised explosive devices (IEDs). The insurgents are continuously adapting both their IEDs and their methods of employment, whereas coalition forces continuously introduce new and improved mine detection and clearance systems and constantly adapt their tactics as well, which requires keeping engineer qualifications up to date.

Threat Level: The density of IEDs in this area of operations is relatively high; most are command-wire detonated. The enemy sometimes overwatches IED emplacements with direct fire weapons.

Incoming Company Mission: The incoming company will replace one of your subordinate route clearance companies which is scheduled to redeploy within the next two months. The incoming company will support a U.S. active component brigade combat team that has started aggressive operations to clear a pervasive insurgent presence from its area of operations.

For the Company scenario, if you had only these companies to choose from, which would you select?

Table 1	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Cost	High: re-missioned from active sector	Moderate: re-missioned from quiet sector	None: just deployed
Manning level	Acceptable 31–35 members	Low 26–30 members	Optimal 36–40 members
Certification	Above average >250%	Above average >250%	Below average <150%
In-country Experience	Low: < 2 weeks	Medium: ~ 1 month	High: 3 months
Component	Active/COMPO1	Active/COMPO1	USAR/COMPO3

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Company Scenario: Scenario is unchanged, options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the operations officer for an engineer brigade supporting an international coalition engaged in ongoing counterinsurgency operations in a developing country. The insurgent presence is more pervasive than originally anticipated. The enemy's primary mode of engagement is emplacing improvised explosive devices (IEDs). The insurgents are continuously adapting both their IEDs and their methods of employment, whereas coalition forces continuously introduce new and improved mine detection and clearance systems and constantly adapt their tactics as well, which requires keeping engineer qualifications up to date.

Threat Level: The density of IEDs in this area of operations is relatively high; most are command-wire detonated. The enemy sometimes overwatches IED emplacements with direct fire weapons.

Incoming Company Mission: The incoming company will replace one of your subordinate route clearance companies which is scheduled to redeploy within the next two months. The incoming company will support a U.S. active component brigade combat team that has started aggressive operations to clear a pervasive insurgent presence from its area of operations.

For the Company scenario, if you had only these companies to choose from, which would you select?

Table 2	Unit A	Unit B	C
Cost	High: re-missioned from active sector	Moderate: re-missioned from quiet sector	High: re-missioned from active sector
Manning level	Acceptable 31–35 members	Low 26–30 members	Optimal 36–40 members
Certification	Below average <150%	Below average <150%	Above average >250%
In-country Experience	Medium: ~1 month	High: 3 months	Low: < 2 weeks
Component	USAR/COMPO3	USAR/COMPO3	Active/COMPO1

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Company Scenario: Scenario is unchanged, options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the operations officer for an engineer brigade supporting an international coalition engaged in ongoing counterinsurgency operations in a developing country. The insurgent presence is more pervasive than originally anticipated. The enemy's primary mode of engagement is emplacing improvised explosive devices (IEDs). The insurgents are continuously adapting both their IEDs and their methods of employment, whereas coalition forces continuously introduce new and improved mine detection and clearance systems and constantly adapt their tactics as well, which requires keeping engineer qualifications up to date.

Threat Level: The density of IEDs in this area of operations is relatively high; most are command-wire detonated. The enemy sometimes overwatches IED emplacements with direct fire weapons.

Incoming Company Mission: The incoming company will replace one of your subordinate route clearance companies which is scheduled to redeploy within the next two months. The incoming company will support a U.S. active component brigade combat team that has started aggressive operations to clear a pervasive insurgent presence from its area of operations.

For the Company scenario, if you had only these companies to choose from, which would you select?

Table 3	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Cost	Moderate: re-missioned from quiet sector	None: just deployed	High: re-missioned from active sector
Manning level	Optimal 36–40 members	Acceptable 31–35 members	Low 26–30 members
Certification	Below average <150%	Below average <150%	Above average >250%
In-country Experience	Medium: ~ 1 month	Low: < 2 weeks	High: 3 months
Component	USAR/COMPO3	Active/COMPO1	Active/COMPO1

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Company Scenario: Scenario is unchanged, options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the operations officer for an engineer brigade supporting an international coalition engaged in ongoing counterinsurgency operations in a developing country. The insurgent presence is more pervasive than originally anticipated. The enemy's primary mode of engagement is emplacing improvised explosive devices (IEDs). The insurgents are continuously adapting both their IEDs and their methods of employment, whereas coalition forces continuously introduce new and improved mine detection and clearance systems and constantly adapt their tactics as well, which requires keeping engineer qualifications up to date.

Threat Level: The density of IEDs in this area of operations is relatively high; most are command-wire detonated. The enemy sometimes overwatches IED emplacements with direct fire weapons.

Incoming Company Mission: The incoming company will replace one of your subordinate route clearance companies which is scheduled to redeploy within the next two months. The incoming company will support a U.S. active component brigade combat team that has started aggressive operations to clear a pervasive insurgent presence from its area of operations.

For the Company scenario, if you had only these companies to choose from, which would you select?

Table 4	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Cost	Moderate: re-missioned from quiet sector	High: re-missioned from active sector	None: just deployed
Manning level	Acceptable 31–35 members	Optimal 36–40 members	Low 26–30 members
Certification	Above average >250%	Below average <150%	Below average <150%
In-country experience	Low: < 2 weeks	Medium: ~ 1 month	Low: < 2 weeks
Component	USAR/COMPO3	Active/COMPO1	USAR/COMPO3

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Company Scenario: Scenario is unchanged, options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the operations officer for an engineer brigade supporting an international coalition engaged in ongoing counterinsurgency operations in a developing country. The insurgent presence is more pervasive than originally anticipated. The enemy's primary mode of engagement is emplacing improvised explosive devices (IEDs). The insurgents are continuously adapting both their IEDs and their methods of employment, whereas coalition forces continuously introduce new and improved mine detection and clearance systems and constantly adapt their tactics as well, which requires keeping engineer qualifications up to date.

Threat Level: The density of IEDs in this area of operations is relatively high; most are command-wire detonated. The enemy sometimes over watches IED emplacements with direct fire weapons.

Incoming Company Mission: The incoming company will replace one of your subordinate route clearance companies which is scheduled to redeploy within the next two months. The incoming company will support a U.S. active component brigade combat team that has started aggressive operations to clear a pervasive insurgent presence from its area of operations.

For the Company scenario, if you had only these companies to choose from, which would you select?

Table 5	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Opportunity Cost	None: just deployed	Moderate: re-missioned from quiet sector	High: re-missioned from active sector
Manning level	Low 26–30 members	Acceptable 31–35 members	Optimal 36–40 members
Certification	Above average >250%	Below average <150%	Above average >250%
In-country Experience	Medium: ~ 1 month	High: 3 months	Low: < 2 weeks
Component	Active/COMPO1	Active/COMPO1	USAR/COMPO3

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Company Scenario: Scenario is unchanged, options differ.

Operational Environment: You are the operations officer for an engineer brigade supporting an international coalition engaged in ongoing counterinsurgency operations in a developing country. The insurgent presence is more pervasive than originally anticipated. The enemy's primary mode of engagement is emplacing improvised explosive devices (IEDs). The insurgents are continuously adapting both their IEDs and their methods of employment, whereas coalition forces continuously introduce new and improved mine detection and clearance systems and constantly adapt their tactics as well, which requires keeping engineer qualifications up to date.

Threat Level: The density of IEDs in this area of operations is relatively high; most are command-wire detonated. The enemy sometimes overwatches IED emplacements with direct fire weapons.

Incoming Company Mission: The incoming company will replace one of your subordinate route clearance companies which is scheduled to redeploy within the next two months. The incoming company will support a U.S. active component brigade combat team that has started aggressive operations to clear a pervasive insurgent presence from its area of operations.

In a couple of sentences, please describe any other company characteristics that would be important to your decision.

When considering various companies, how important to you are each of the following factors for making your choice?

Feature of Specific Company	Rating				
	1	2	3	4	5
	Not at all Important	Slightly Important	Somewhat Important	Very Important	Extremely Important
Cost	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Effectiveness	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Component	<input type="checkbox"/>				
C2 Capability	<input type="checkbox"/>				

Military Police Companies

Part I: Introduction

Your Task: You are the commander of an MP battalion supporting several brigade combat teams (BCTs) conducting counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing country. One of the companies assigned to your battalion is scheduled to redeploy within the next four weeks; you must choose a unit to replace it in its area of operations.

You will be presented with a scenario which is a thumbnail sketch of human and physical terrain, enemy capabilities and level of activity, and the incoming unit's mission.

There are five rounds to this exercise. In each round, you will be asked to choose the most appropriate unit from one of three choices. The units differs with respect to several characteristics, including:

- Whether or not the unit has already completed its prescribed in-country training (validation)
- Personnel fill
- Army component (Active or Army Reserve)
- Level of in-country experience
- The cost of employing this particular unit, in terms of risk accepted elsewhere.

Choices will be presented in table format.

Continue

Part II—Unit Attributes

The information will be described in a table form as follows.

Cost: This characteristic describes the additional risk you will incur by selecting a particular option. There are three levels of opportunity cost:

- **None**: unit is deploying to replace the outgoing company.
- **Moderate**: The unit described is currently supporting an allied brigade in a quiet sector. Re-missioning the unit would increase friction and increase risk somewhat, but would be unlikely to fundamentally alter the situation in the allied brigade's area of operations.
- **High**: The unit is providing effective support to a U.S. brigade in a strategically important area of operations. Diverting the company could significantly disrupt progress, especially in developing host nation police forces.

Cost	None: just deployed	Moderate: re-missioned from quiet sector	High: re-missioned from active sector
-------------	---------------------	--	---------------------------------------

In-country Experience: All units are available for your mission for up to 6 months, but they have varying degrees of in-country experience:

- **None**: a company is scheduled to arrive next week
- **3 months**: a company been in country for 3 months
- **6 months**: a company has been in country for 6 months

In-country Experience	None	3 months	6 months
------------------------------	------	----------	----------

Force Structure Component: MP companies will be from either:

- **USAR/COMPO3**: U.S. Army Reserve
- **Active/COMPO1**: Active component

Component	USAR/COMPO3	Active/COMPO1
------------------	-------------	---------------

Personnel Level: Every assigned MP company must have the ability to organize and field sufficiently manned Security Forces Assistance Teams (SFATs) at the squad level to meet all Host nation training requirements. Manning levels will be labeled as follows:

- Under-manned
- Acceptable
- Fully manned

Personnel Level	Under-manned	Acceptable	Fully manned
------------------------	--------------	------------	--------------

Validation: Given the complexity and priority of the Security Force Assistance Training (SFAT) mission, your MP brigade commander has instituted a company level training validation program to ensure all MP companies understand the appropriate training techniques for use with their Host nation national police/Host nation Border Police (/ABP) counterparts:

- **Yes, completed** will indicate that a company has completed the validation program
- **No, not completed** will indicate that a company has not completed it

Validation	Yes, completed	No, not completed
-------------------	----------------	-------------------

Assume that this is the only information available to distinguish between units, and that all units are available at the time you need them and armed with the equipment required for the mission.

Ready to Begin

Part III—Mission

You will be given a mission scenario. After the scenario you will be presented with 5 different tables. At each table you will choose the most appropriate U.S. MP companies for the operational environment and threat level provided in the scenario.

You will not be able to go back to the previous table. There are no right or wrong answers to the question. We are interested in your professional judgment.

**Begin
Scenario**

Scenario

Operational Environment: You are the commander of an MP battalion supporting ongoing counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing country. Your battalion is also providing oversight of Security Force Assistance Training to a Host nation national police brigade to increase their capacity to conduct sustained independent operations and to secure the local population.

Threat Level: The density of IEDs in your area of operations is relatively high and represents the most dangerous threat to both US and Host nation forces.

Your Mission: Your primary task entails organizing and fielding of squad level Security Force Assistance Teams focused on the mentoring of local Host nation units, IED identification, patrolling techniques, and community police techniques (i.e., enforcement of local laws). One of the MP companies that is currently supporting an engineering company engaged in combined arms route clearance for the area of operations is scheduled to be relieved from theater next month and your task is to recommend a replacement. The mission of the incoming MP unit will be focused on supporting route clearance and training Host nation counterparts on these techniques.

If you had only these units to choose from, which would you select?

Table 1	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Validation	Yes, completed	No, not completed	No, not completed
Cost	None: just deployed	Moderate: re-missioned from quiet sector	High: re-missioned from active sector
In-country Experience	3 months	6 months	6 months
Component	USAR/COMPO3	Active/COMPO1	Active/COMPO1
Personnel Level	Acceptable	Acceptable	Fully manned

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario: Unchanged

Operational Environment: You are the commander of an MP battalion supporting ongoing counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing country. Your battalion is also providing oversight of Security Force Assistance Training to a Host nation national police brigade to increase their capacity to conduct sustained independent operations and to secure the local population.

Threat Level: The density of IEDs in your area of operations is relatively high and represents the most dangerous threat to both US and Host nation forces.

Your Mission: Your primary task entails organizing and fielding of squad level Security Force Assistance Teams focused on the mentoring of local Host nation units, IED identification, patrolling techniques, and community police techniques (i.e., enforcement of local laws). One of the MP companies that is currently supporting an engineers company engaged in combined arms route clearance for the area of operations is scheduled to be relieved from theater next month and your task is to recommend a replacement. The mission of the incoming MP unit will be focused on supporting route clearance and training Host nation counterparts on these techniques.

If you had only these units to choose from, which would you select?

Table 2	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Validation	No, not completed	Yes, completed	Yes, completed
Cost	None: just deployed	Moderate: re-missioned from quiet sector	High; re-missioned from active sector
In-country Experience	3 months	3 months	6 months
Component	Active/COMPO1	Active/COMPO1	USAR/COMPO3
Personnel Level	Fully manned	Under-manned	Acceptable

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario: Unchanged

Operational Environment: You are the commander of an MP battalion supporting ongoing counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing country. Your battalion is also providing oversight of Security Force Assistance Training to a Host nation national police brigade to increase their capacity to conduct sustained independent operations and to secure the local population.

Threat Level: The density of IEDs in your area of operations is relatively high and represents the most dangerous threat to both US and Host nation forces.

Your Mission: Your primary task entails organizing and fielding of squad level Security Force Assistance Teams focused on the mentoring of local Host nation units, IED identification, patrolling techniques, and community police techniques (i.e., enforcement of local laws). One of the MP companies that is currently supporting an engineers company engaged in combined arms route clearance for the area of operations is scheduled to be relieved from theater next month and your task is to recommend a replacement. The mission of the incoming MP unit will be focused on supporting route clearance and training Host nation counterparts on these techniques.

If you had only these units to choose from, which would you select?

Table 3	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Validation	No, not completed	Yes, completed	No, not completed
Cost	None: just deployed	None: just deployed	Moderate: re-missioned from quiet sector
In-country Experience	None	6 months	3 months
Component	Active/COMPO1	USAR/COMPO3	USAR/COMPO3
Personnel Level	Fully manned	Under-manned	Acceptable

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario: Unchanged

Operational Environment: You are the commander of an MP battalion supporting ongoing counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing country. Your battalion is also providing oversight of Security Force Assistance Training to a Host nation national police brigade to increase their capacity to conduct sustained independent operations and to secure the local population.

Threat Level: The density of IEDs in your area of operations is relatively high and represents the most dangerous threat to both US and Host nation forces.

Your Mission: Your primary task entails organizing and fielding of squad level Security Force Assistance Teams focused on the mentoring of local Host nation units, IED identification, patrolling techniques, and community police techniques (i.e., enforcement of local laws). One of the MP companies that is currently supporting an engineers company engaged in combined arms route clearance for the area of operations is scheduled to be relieved from theater next month and your task is to recommend a replacement. The mission of the incoming MP unit will be focused on supporting route clearance and training Host nation counterparts on these techniques.

If you had only these units to choose from, which would you select?

Table 4	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Validation	No, not completed	Yes, completed	Yes, completed
Cost	None: just deployed	High: re-missioned from active sector	Moderate: re-missioned from quiet sector
In-country Experience	None	3 months	6 months
Component	USAR/COMPO3	Active/COMPO1	USAR/COMPO3
Personnel Level	Acceptable	Under-manned	Fully manned

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario: Unchanged

Operational Environment: You are the commander of an MP battalion supporting ongoing counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing country. Your battalion is also providing oversight of Security Force Assistance Training to a Host nation national police brigade to increase their capacity to conduct sustained independent operations and to secure the local population.

Threat Level: The density of IEDs in your area of operations is relatively high and represents the most dangerous threat to both US and Host nation forces.

Your Mission: Your primary task entails organizing and fielding of squad level Security Force Assistance Teams focused on the mentoring of local Host nation units, IED identification, patrolling techniques, and community police techniques (i.e., enforcement of local laws). One of the MP companies that is currently supporting an engineers company engaged in combined arms route clearance for the area of operations is scheduled to be relieved from theater next month and your task is to recommend a replacement. The mission of the incoming MP unit will be focused on supporting route clearance and training Host nation counterparts on these techniques.

If you had only these units to choose from, which would you select?

Table 5	Unit A	Unit B	Unit C
Validation	No, not completed	Yes, completed	No, not completed
Cost	None: just deployed	None: just deployed	Moderate: remissioned from quiet sector
In-country Experience	6 months	None	3 months
Component	Active/COMPO1	USAR/COMPO3	USAR/COMPO3
Personnel Level	Acceptable	Under-manned	Fully manned

Choose ONLY one unit: _____

Scenario: Unchanged

Operational Environment: You are the commander of an MP battalion supporting ongoing counterinsurgency operations in a medium-sized developing country. Your battalion is also providing oversight of Security Force Assistance Training to a Host nation national police brigade to increase their capacity to conduct sustained independent operations and to secure the local population.

Threat Level: The density of IEDs in your area of operations is relatively high and represents the most dangerous threat to both US and Host nation forces.

Your Mission: Your primary task entails organizing and fielding of squad level Security Force Assistance Teams focused on the mentoring of local Host nation units, IED identification, patrolling techniques, and community police techniques (i.e., enforcement of local laws). One of the MP companies that is currently supporting an engineers company engaged in combined arms route clearance for the area of operations is scheduled to be relieved from theater next month and your task is to recommend a replacement. The mission of the incoming MP unit will be focused on supporting route clearance and training Host nation counterparts on these techniques.

In a couple of sentences, please describe any other unit characteristics that would be important to your decision.

When considering various units, how important to you are each of the following factors for making your choice?

Feature of Specific Unit	Rating				
	1	2	3	4	5
	Not at all Important	Slightly Important	Somewhat Important	Very Important	Extremely Important
Validation	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Cost	<input type="checkbox"/>				
In-country experience	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Component	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Personnel level	<input type="checkbox"/>				

Individuals

Your Task

In this survey we will ask you to consider a number of hypothetical personnel profiles, and will ask you about your preferences in allocating the personnel to different positions. Think about your preference between the choices as if they were real. You should assume that the information provided in the hypothetical personnel profiles is all that would be available to make the decision. Thus, make your choice based on that information and your past experience, knowledge, and training. There are no wrong or right answers; we are only interested in your views.

Your Mission

You are the chief of staff of a 500-person combined headquarters providing strategic direction to U.S. military efforts in a small-scale counterinsurgency campaign. As officers rotate out, you will fill vacancies in the following directorates: operations, programs and resources, and strategic plans. While Army Human Resources Command (HRC) assigns officers against these vacancies, you prefer to make the final decision yourself based on the officers' personal characteristics. Your staff identified candidates for each position from among the incoming officers. You interviewed each of the officers upon their arrival, and they all appear competent. Individual candidates will differ along the characteristics described in the next screen.

Continue

PART II: Individual Attributes—Tutorial

Period of Availability: the amount of time for which the officer is available for assignment. The options will **range from 6 months to 12 months**.

Military Branch: the branch designation of the officer under consideration. The branch designations will be spelled out by their title, i.e. **Acquisition (51), Air Defense Artillery (14), Logistician (90), Military Intelligence (35), Strategist (FA59)**

Prior Deployment Experience: whether the officer has had prior deployment experience doing related work **within the last 2 to 5 years**.

Component: whether the officer is **Active Component (AC), Army Reserve (USAR), or Army National Guard (ARNG)**

Civilian Acquired Skill: indicates whether an ARNG or USAR officer has an equivalent or relevant skill set, acquired through civilian training or employment. Some USAR and ARNG officers will have no relevant civilian acquired skills and will be labeled as “none.” Assume that Active Component (AC) officers have no relevant civilian acquired skills and will be labeled as “N/A.” The possible Civilian Acquired Skills are

- District Manager for a small retail chain
- Vice President of Operations for a trucking company
- Contracting Manager for a small manufacturing firm
- District Contracting Official, U.S. Army Corps of Engineers
- Assistant District Attorney
- Police Lieutenant in a medium-sized city

**Ready to
Begin**

PART III: Mission

You will be given 3 scenarios based on different available assignments. For each scenario you will be presented with 5 rounds of tables describing different combinations of personal attributes. In each table you will be asked to choose the most capable person for this assignment.

You will not be able to go back to the previous table. There are no right or wrong answers to the question. We are interested in your opinion.

**Begin
Scenario
1**

Scenario 1: Desk Officer for Operations Directorate

Your task:

You must replace one of your regional command desk officers, an O-4 position. The Director of Operations (CJ-3) created these desk officer positions to monitor developments in the command's four regional commands.

Description of responsibilities:

- reporting to you and your commander on ongoing activity at any given moment in the regional command for which the desk officers are responsible
- providing updates on whether the coalition and host nation government are winning or losing, and why
- monitoring military operations undertaken by your subordinate combined joint task force (CJTF) and any significant air operations, as well as independent actions taken by other U.S. government agencies, the host nation government, and non-governmental organizations

Required skills:

- must be able to navigate U.S. military processes
- should understand how theater operations might affect popular support for the coalition and host nation government

Of the three officers below, who in your opinion is the best choice to fill this vacancy?

Choose ONLY one individual: _____

Round 1: Desk Officer for Operations Directorate (O-4)

	A	B	C
Civilian-Acquired Skill	Vice President of Operations for a trucking company Directs the operations and activities of the trucking company Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scheduling and coordination • Monitoring status of all pickups and deliveries across several states • Scheduling maintenance 	District Manager for a small retail chain Manages several stores Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sales, costs, and profitability of stores • Marketing and advertising within his district • Implementing corporate initiatives 	None Has no relevant civilian acquired skills.
Component	USAR	ARNG	ARNG
Period of Availability	6 months	12 months	6 months
Military Branch	Air Defense Artillery	Logistics	Air Defense Artillery
Prior Deployment Experience	4 years ago	3 years ago	2 years ago

Choose ONLY one individual: _____

Scenario 1: Desk Officer for Operations Directorate

Your task:

You must replace one of your regional command desk officers, an O-4 position. The Director of Operations (CJ-3) created these desk officer positions to monitor developments in the command's four regional commands.

Description of responsibilities:

- reporting to you and your commander on ongoing activity at any given moment in the regional command for which the desk officers are responsible
- providing updates on whether the coalition and host nation government are winning or losing, and why
- monitoring military operations undertaken by your subordinate combined joint task force (CJTF) and any significant air operations, as well as independent actions taken by other U.S. government agencies, the host nation government, and non-governmental organizations

Required skills:

- must be able to navigate U.S. military processes
- should understand how theater operations might affect popular support for the coalition and host nation government

Of the three officers below, who in your opinion is the best choice to fill this vacancy?

Round 2: Desk Officer for Operations Directorate (O-4)

	A	B	C
Civilian-Acquired Skill	None Has no relevant civilian acquired skills.	District Manager for a small retail chain Manages several stores Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sales, costs, and profitability of stores • Marketing and advertising within his district • Implementing corporate initiatives 	N/A Active Component (AC) officers have no relevant civilian acquired skills and are labeled as "N/A."
Component	USAR	ARNG	AC [Active component]
Period of Availability	12 months	12 months	6 months
Military Branch	Logistics	Air Defense Artillery	Logistics
Prior Deployment Experience	4 years ago	2 years ago	3 years ago

Choose ONLY one individual: _____

Scenario 1: Desk Officer for Operations Directorate

Your task:

You must replace one of your regional command desk officers, an O-4 position. The Director of Operations (CJ-3) created these desk officer positions to monitor developments in the command's four regional commands.

Description of responsibilities:

- reporting to you and your commander on ongoing activity at any given moment in the regional command for which the desk officers are responsible
- providing updates on whether the coalition and host nation government are winning or losing, and why
- monitoring military operations undertaken by your subordinate combined joint task force (CJTF) and any significant air operations, as well as independent actions taken by other U.S. government agencies, the host nation government, and non-governmental organizations

Required skills:

- must be able to navigate U.S. military processes
- should understand how theater operations might affect popular support for the coalition and host nation government.

Of the three officers below, who in your opinion is the best choice to fill this vacancy?

Round 3: Desk Officer for Operations Directorate (O-4)

	A	B	C
Civilian Acquired Skill	N/A Active Component (AC) officers have no relevant civilian acquired skills and are labeled as "N/A."	Vice President of Operations for a trucking company Directs the operations and activities of the trucking company Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scheduling and coordination • Monitoring status of all pickups and deliveries across several states • Scheduling maintenance 	District Manager for a small retail chain Manages several stores Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sales, costs, and profitability of stores • Marketing and advertising within his district • Implementing corporate initiatives
Component	AC	ARNG	USAR
Period of Availability	12 months	12 months	6 months
Military Branch	Logistics	Air Defense Artillery	Logistics
Prior Deployment Experience	4 years ago	3 years ago	3 years ago

Choose ONLY one individual: _____

Scenario 1: Desk Officer for Operations Directorate

Your task:

You must replace one of your regional command desk officers, an O-4 position. The Director of Operations (CJ-3) created these desk officer positions to monitor developments in the command's four regional commands.

Description of responsibilities:

- reporting to you and your commander on ongoing activity at any given moment in the regional command for which the desk officers are responsible
- providing updates on whether the coalition and host nation government are winning or losing, and why
- monitoring military operations undertaken by your subordinate combined joint task force (CJTF) and any significant air operations, as well as independent actions taken by other U.S. government agencies, the host nation government, and non-governmental organizations

Required skills:

- must be able to navigate U.S. military processes
- should understand how theater operations might affect popular support for the coalition and host nation government

Of the three officers below, who in your opinion is the best choice to fill this vacancy?

Round 4: Desk Officer for Operations Directorate (O-4)

	A	B	C
Civilian Acquired Skill	Vice President of Operations for a trucking company Directs the operations and activities of the trucking company Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scheduling and coordination • Monitoring status of all pickups and deliveries across several states • Scheduling maintenance 	None Has no relevant civilian acquired skills.	N/A Active Component (AC) officers have no relevant civilian acquired skills and are labeled as "N/A."
Component	ARNG	USAR	AC
Period of Availability	6 months	12 months	6 months
Military Branch	Logistics	Air Defense Artillery	Air Defense Artillery
Prior Deployment Experience	2 years ago	3 years ago	4 years ago

Choose ONLY one individual: _____

Scenario 1: Desk Officer for Operations Directorate

Your task:

- You must replace one of your regional command desk officers, an O-4 position. The Director of Operations (CJ-3) created these desk officer positions to monitor developments in the command's four regional commands.

Description of responsibilities:

- reporting to you and your commander on ongoing activity at any given moment in the regional command for which the desk officers are responsible
- providing updates on whether the coalition and host nation government are winning or losing, and why
- monitoring military operations undertaken by your subordinate combined joint task force (CJTF) and any significant air operations, as well as independent actions taken by other U.S. government agencies, the host nation government, and non-governmental organizations

Required skills:

- must be able to navigate U.S. military processes
- should understand how theater operations might affect popular support for the coalition and host nation government

Of the three officers below, who in your opinion is the best choice to fill this vacancy?

Round 5: Desk Officer for Operations Directorate (O-4)

	A	B	C
Civilian Acquired Skill	N/A Active Component (AC) officers have no relevant civilian acquired skills and are labeled as "N/A."	Vice President of Operations for a trucking company Directs the operations and activities of the trucking company Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scheduling and coordination • Monitoring status of all pickups and deliveries across several states • Scheduling maintenance 	None Has no relevant civilian acquired skills.
Component	AC	USAR	ARNG
Period of Availability	6 months	6 months	12 months
Military Branch	Air Defense Artillery	Logistics	Logistics
Prior Deployment Experience	3 years ago	2 years ago	4 years ago

Choose ONLY one individual: _____

In a couple of sentences, please describe the individual who, in your opinion, is the most suited for this vacancy:

Great job!

You have completed the first scenario. You are ready to proceed to scenario 2.

**Begin Scenario
2**

Scenario 2: Programs and Resources Directorate Vacancy

Your task:

Now you must identify a replacement for the Programs and Resources Directorate vacancy, an O-5 position, at the same theater-level command. The command's objective is to develop a robust host nation and regional base of vendors to provide bulk supplies, as well as transportation and maintenance services to host nation forces after U.S. forces transfer primary responsibility for security operations.

Description of responsibilities:

- planning and coordinating centralized contract logistics support for U.S. and host nation forces
- mentoring and training host nation officers for subsequent transfer of this effort to the host nation

Required skills:

- ability to assess local vendors' existing capacity, reliability, and trustworthiness and their potential to improve
- understanding of existing host nation laws and policies and the ability to think beyond the usual U.S. supply chain

Of the three officers below, who in your opinion is the best choice to fill this vacancy?

Round 1: Programs and Resources Directorate Vacancy (O-5)

	A	B	C
Civilian Acquired Skill	Contracting Manager for a small manufacturing firm Manages purchasing operations, vendors' reliability and cost Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> developing and sustaining a network of suppliers for raw materials, components (i.e., fuses, assemblies) developing and sustaining a network for support services (waste disposal, accounting, etc.) 	District Contracting Official, U.S. Army Corps of Engineers Very experienced in managing contract operations Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> soliciting contract support for construction, professional support, and administrative support for an engineer district working within the framework provided by the Federal Acquisition Regulation (FAR) 	N/A Active Component (AC) officers have no relevant civilian acquired skills and are labeled as "N/A."
Component	USAR	ARRNG	AC
Period of Availability	6 months	12 months	12 months
Military Branch	Acquisition	Logistics	Acquisition
Prior Deployment Experience	3 years	3 years	4 years

Choose ONLY one individual: _____

Scenario 2: Programs and Resources Directorate Vacancy

Your task:

Now you must identify a replacement for the Programs and Resources Directorate vacancy, an O-5 position, at the same theater-level command. The command's objective is to develop a robust host nation and regional base of vendors to provide bulk supplies, as well as transportation and maintenance services to host nation forces after U.S. forces transfer primary responsibility for security operations.

Description of responsibilities:

- planning and coordinating centralized contract logistics support for U.S. and host nation forces
- mentoring and training host nation officers for subsequent transfer of this effort to the host nation

Required skills:

- ability to assess local vendors' existing capacity, reliability, and trustworthiness and their potential to improve
- understanding of existing host nation laws and policies and the ability to think beyond the usual U.S. supply chain

Of the three officers below, who in your opinion is the best choice to fill this vacancy?

Round 2: Programs and Resources Directorate Vacancy (O-5)

	A	B	C
Civilian Acquired Skill	None Has no relevant civilian acquired skills.	District Contracting Official, U.S. Army Corps of Engineers Very experienced in managing contract operations Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> soliciting contract support for construction, professional support, and administrative support for an engineer district working within the framework provided by the Federal Acquisition Regulation (FAR) 	N/A Active Component (AC) officers have no relevant civilian acquired skills and are labeled as "N/A."
Component	USAR	ARNG	AC
Period of Availability	12 months	6 months	6 months
Military Branch	Logistics	Acquisition	Logistics
Prior Deployment Experience	3 years	2 years	4 years

Choose ONLY one individual: _____

Scenario 2: Programs and Resources Directorate Vacancy

Your task:

Now you must identify a replacement for the Programs and Resources Directorate vacancy, an O-5 position, at the same theater-level command. The command's objective is to develop a robust host nation and regional base of vendors to provide bulk supplies, as well as transportation and maintenance services to host nation forces after U.S. forces transfer primary responsibility for security operations.

Description of responsibilities:

- planning and coordinating centralized contract logistics support for U.S. and host nation forces
- mentoring and training host nation officers for subsequent transfer of this effort to the host nation

Required skills:

- ability to assess local vendors' existing capacity, reliability, and trustworthiness and their potential to improve
- understanding of existing host nation laws and policies and the ability to think beyond the usual U.S. supply chain

Of the three officers below, who in your opinion is the best choice to fill this vacancy?

Round 3: Programs and Resources Directorate Vacancy (O-5)

	A	B	C
Civilian Acquired Skill	None Has no relevant civilian acquired skills.	District Contracting Official, U.S. Army Corps of Engineers Very experienced in managing contract operations Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> soliciting contract support for construction, professional support, and administrative support for an engineer district working within the framework provided by the Federal Acquisition Regulation (FAR) 	Contracting Manager for a small manufacturing firm Manages purchasing operations, vendors' reliability and cost Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> developing and sustaining a network of suppliers for raw materials, components (i.e., fuses, assemblies) developing and sustaining a network for support services (waste disposal, accounting, etc.)
Component	ARNG	USAR	ARNG
Period of Availability	6 months	6 months	12 months
Military Branch	Logistics	Logistics	Acquisition
Prior Deployment Experience	2 years	4 years	3 years

Choose ONLY one individual: _____

Scenario 2: Programs and Resources Directorate Vacancy

Your task:

Now you must identify a replacement for the Programs and Resources Directorate vacancy, an O-5 position, at the same theater-level command. The command's objective is to develop a robust host nation and regional base of vendors to provide bulk supplies, as well as transportation and maintenance services to host nation forces after U.S. forces transfer primary responsibility for security operations.

Description of responsibilities:

- planning and coordinating centralized contract logistics support for U.S. and host nation forces
- mentoring and training host nation officers for subsequent transfer of this effort to the host nation

Required skills:

- ability to assess local vendors' existing capacity, reliability, and trustworthiness and their potential to improve
- understanding of existing host nation laws and policies and the ability to think beyond the usual U.S. supply chain

Of the three officers below, who in your opinion is the best choice to fill this vacancy?

Round 4: Programs and Resources Directorate Vacancy (O-5)

	A	B	C
Civilian Acquired Skill	None Has no relevant civilian acquired skills.	N/A Active Component (AC) officers have no relevant civilian acquired skills and are labeled as "N/A."	Contracting Manager for a small manufacturing firm Manages purchasing operations, vendors' reliability and cost Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • developing and sustaining a network of suppliers for raw materials, components (i.e., fuses, assemblies) • developing and sustaining a network for support services (waste disposal, accounting, etc.)
Component	USAR	AC	ARNG
Period of Availability	12 months	6 months	12 months
Military Branch	Acquisition	Acquisition	Logistics
Prior Deployment Experience	4 years	3 years	2 years

Choose ONLY one individual: _____

Scenario 2: Programs and Resources Directorate Vacancy

Your task:

Now you must identify a replacement for the Programs and Resources Directorate vacancy, an O-5 position, at the same theater-level command. The command's objective is to develop a robust host nation and regional base of vendors to provide bulk supplies, as well as transportation and maintenance services to host nation forces after U.S. forces transfer primary responsibility for security operations.

Description of responsibilities:

- planning and coordinating centralized contract logistics support for U.S. and host nation forces
- mentoring and training host nation officers for subsequent transfer of this effort to the host nation

Required skills:

- ability to assess local vendors' existing capacity, reliability, and trustworthiness and their potential to improve
- understanding of existing host nation laws and policies and the ability to think beyond the usual U.S. supply chain

Of the three officers below, who in your opinion is the best choice to fill this vacancy?

Round 5: Programs and Resources Directorate Vacancy (O-5)

	A	B	C
Civilian Acquired Skill	N/A Active Component (AC) officers have no relevant civilian acquired skills and are labeled as "N/A."	None Has no relevant civilian acquired skills.	District Contracting Official, U.S. Army Corps of Engineers Very experienced in managing contract operations Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • soliciting contract support for construction, professional support, and administrative support for an engineer district • working within the framework provided by the Federal Acquisition Regulation (FAR)
Component	AC	ARNG	USAR
Period of Availability	6 months	12 months	6 months
Military Branch	Logistics	Acquisition	Acquisition
Prior Deployment Experience	3 years	4 years	2 years

Choose ONLY one individual: _____

Scenario 2: Programs and Resources Directorate Vacancy

Your task:

Now you must identify a replacement for the Programs and Resources Directorate vacancy, an O-5 position, at the same theater-level command. The command's objective is to develop a robust host nation and regional base of vendors to provide bulk supplies, as well as transportation and maintenance services to host nation forces after U.S. forces transfer primary responsibility for security operations.

Description of responsibilities:

- planning and coordinating centralized contract logistics support for U.S. and host nation forces
- mentoring and training host nation officers for subsequent transfer of this effort to the host nation

Required skills:

- ability to assess local vendors' existing capacity, reliability, and trustworthiness and their potential to improve
- understanding of existing host nation laws and policies and the ability to think beyond the usual U.S. supply chain

In a couple of sentences, please describe the individual who, in your opinion, is the most suited for this vacancy:

Great job!

You have completed the first scenario. You are ready to proceed to scenario 3.

**Begin Scenario
3**

Scenario 3: Counter-narcotics Planner, Directorate of Strategic Plans and Policy (CJ-5)

Your task:

Your third and final task is to identify a replacement for the Counter-narcotics Planner, Directorate of Strategic Plans and Policy (CJ-5) vacancy, an O-5 position. Counter-narcotics are nominally a State Department lead, but the lucrative narcotics trade and the associated criminal networks have significant impacts on security efforts. Insurgents derive much of their revenue from trafficking in narcotics, and use criminal networks to move money, people, and weapons.

Description of responsibilities:

- planning and coordinating intelligence, surveillance, reconnaissance (ISR) and security activities in support of counter-narcotics operations
- developing host nation security forces, including general and special police forces responsible for aspects of the counter-narcotics mission

Required skills:

- developing the command's counter-narcotics strategy
- coordinating with the local embassy, host-nation government, United Nations (UN) and representatives of allied governments' counter-narcotic operations

Of the three officers below, who in your opinion is the best choice to fill this vacancy?

Round 1: Counter-narcotics Planner, Directorate of Strategic Plans and Policy (CJ-5) (O-5)

	A	B	C
Civilian Acquired Skill	N/A Active Component (AC) officers have no relevant civilian acquired skills and are labeled as "N/A."	Police Lieutenant in a medium-sized city Supervises and coordinates the investigation of criminal cases with other police divisions and jurisdictions Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> maintaining logs, preparing reports, and directing the preparation, handling, and maintenance of departmental records 	None Has no relevant civilian acquired skills.
Component	AC	ARNG	USAR
Period of Availability	6 months	12 months	12 months
Military Branch	Logistics	Air Defense Artillery	Logistics
Prior Deployment Experience	3 years	2 years	4 years

Choose ONLY one individual: _____

Scenario 3: Counter-narcotics Planner, Directorate of Strategic Plans and Policy (CJ-5)

Your task:

Your third and final task is to identify a replacement for the Counter-narcotics Planner, Directorate of Strategic Plans and Policy (CJ-5) vacancy, an O-5 position. Counter-narcotics are nominally a State Department lead, but the lucrative narcotics trade and the associated criminal networks have significant impacts on security efforts. Insurgents derive much of their revenue from trafficking in narcotics, and use criminal networks to move money, people, and weapons.

Description of responsibilities:

- planning and coordinating intelligence, surveillance, reconnaissance (ISR) and security activities in support of counter-narcotics operations
- developing host nation security forces, including general and special police forces responsible for aspects of the counter-narcotics mission

Required skills:

- developing the command's counter-narcotics strategy
- coordinating with the local embassy, host-nation government, United Nations (UN) and representatives of allied governments' counter-narcotic operations

Of the three officers below, who in your opinion is the best choice to fill this vacancy?

Round 2: Counter-narcotics Planner, Directorate of Strategic Plans and Policy (CJ-5) (O-5)

	A	B	C
Civilian Acquired Skill	None Has no relevant civilian acquired skills.	Police Lieutenant in a medium-sized city Supervises and coordinates the investigation of criminal cases with other police divisions and jurisdictions Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> maintaining logs, preparing reports, and directing the preparation, handling, and maintenance of departmental records 	Assistant District Attorney Supervises the development of criminal cases Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> coordinating jurisdiction and investigations with federal, state, and local law enforcement agencies helping set priorities for enforcement and prosecution remaining keenly aware of public perceptions of law enforcement efforts' fairness and legitimacy
Component	ARNG	ARNG	USAR
Period of Availability	6 months	12 months	6 months
Military Branch	Air Defense Artillery	Logistics	Air Defense Artillery
Prior Deployment Experience	2 years	3 years	4 years

Choose ONLY one individual: _____

Scenario 3: Counter-narcotics Planner, Directorate of Strategic Plans and Policy (CJ-5)

Your task:

Your third and final task is to identify a replacement for the Counter-narcotics Planner, Directorate of Strategic Plans and Policy (CJ-5) vacancy, an O-5 position. Counter-narcotics are nominally a State Department lead, but the lucrative narcotics trade and the associated criminal networks have significant impacts on security efforts. Insurgents derive much of their revenue from trafficking in narcotics, and use criminal networks to move money, people, and weapons.

Description of responsibilities:

- planning and coordinating intelligence, surveillance, reconnaissance (ISR) and security activities in support of counter-narcotics operations
- developing host nation security forces, including general and special police forces responsible for aspects of the counter-narcotics mission

Required skills:

- developing the command's counter-narcotics strategy
- coordinating with the local embassy, host-nation government, United Nations (UN) and representatives of allied governments' counter-narcotic operations

Of the three officers below, who in your opinion is the best choice to fill this vacancy?

Round 3: Counter-narcotics Planner, Directorate of Strategic Plans and Policy (CJ-5) (O-5)

	A	B	C
Civilian Acquired Skill	N/A Active Component (AC) officers have no relevant civilian acquired skills and are labeled as "N/A."	Assistant District Attorney Supervises the development of criminal cases Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • coordinating jurisdiction and investigations with federal, state, and local law enforcement agencies • helping set priorities for enforcement and prosecution • remaining keenly aware of public perceptions of law enforcement efforts' fairness and legitimacy 	Police Lieutenant in a medium-sized city Supervises and coordinates the investigation of criminal cases with other police divisions and jurisdictions Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintaining logs, preparing reports, and directing the preparation, handling, and maintenance of departmental records
Component	AC	ARNG	USAR
Period of Availability	12 months	12 months	6 months
Military Branch	Logistics	Air Defense Artillery	Logistics
Prior Deployment Experience	4 years	3 years	3 years

Choose ONLY one individual: _____

Scenario 3: Counter-narcotics Planner, Directorate of Strategic Plans and Policy (CJ-5)

Your task:

Your third and final task is to identify a replacement for the Counter-narcotics Planner, Directorate of Strategic Plans and Policy (CJ-5) vacancy, an O-5 position. Counter-narcotics are nominally a State Department lead, but the lucrative narcotics trade and the associated criminal networks have significant impacts on security efforts. Insurgents derive much of their revenue from trafficking in narcotics, and use criminal networks to move money, people, and weapons.

Description of responsibilities:

- planning and coordinating intelligence, surveillance, reconnaissance (ISR) and security activities in support of counter-narcotics operations
- developing host nation security forces, including general and special police forces responsible for aspects of the counter-narcotics mission

Required skills:

- developing the command's counter-narcotics strategy
- coordinating with the local embassy, host nation government, United Nations (UN) and representatives of allied governments' counter-narcotic operations

Of the three officers below, who in your opinion is the best choice to fill this vacancy?

Round 4: Counter-narcotics Planner, Directorate of Strategic Plans and Policy (CJ-5) (O-5)

	A	B	C
Civilian Acquired Skill	None Has no relevant civilian acquired skills.	Assistant District Attorney Supervises the development of criminal cases Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • coordinating jurisdiction and investigations with federal, state, and local law enforcement agencies • helping set priorities for enforcement and prosecution • remaining keenly aware of public perceptions of law enforcement efforts' fairness and legitimacy 	N/A Active Component (AC) officers have no relevant civilian acquired skills and are labeled as "N/A."
Component	ARNG	USAR	AC
Period of Availability	12 months	6 months	6 months
Military Branch	Logistics	Logistics	Air Defense Artillery
Prior Deployment Experience	4 years	2 years	3 years

Choose ONLY one individual: _____

Scenario 3: Counter-narcotics Planner, Directorate of Strategic Plans and Policy (CJ-5)

Your task:

Your third and final task is to identify a replacement for the Counter-narcotics Planner, Directorate of Strategic Plans and Policy (CJ-5) vacancy, an O-5 position. Counter-narcotics are nominally a State Department lead, but the lucrative narcotics trade and the associated criminal networks have significant impacts on security efforts. Insurgents derive much of their revenue from trafficking in narcotics, and use criminal networks to move money, people, and weapons.

Description of responsibilities:

- planning and coordinating intelligence, surveillance, reconnaissance (ISR) and security activities in support of counter-narcotics operations
- developing host nation security forces, including general and special police forces responsible for aspects of the counter-narcotics mission

Required skills:

- developing the command's counter-narcotics strategy
- coordinating with the local embassy, host-nation government, United Nations (UN) and representatives of allied governments' counter-narcotic operations

Of the three officers below, who in your opinion is the best choice to fill this vacancy?

Round 5: Counter-narcotics Planner, Directorate of Strategic Plans and Policy (CJ-5) (O-5)

	A	B	C
Civilian Acquired Skill	Assistant District Attorney Supervises the development of criminal cases Responsible for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • coordinating jurisdiction and investigations with federal, state, and local law enforcement agencies • helping set priorities for enforcement and prosecution • remaining keenly aware of public perceptions of law enforcement efforts' fairness and legitimacy 	N/A Active Component (AC) officers have no relevant civilian acquired skills and are labeled as "N/A."	None Has no relevant civilian acquired skills.
Component	ARNG	AC	USAR
Period of Availability	6 months	6 months	12 months
Military Branch	Logistics	Air Defense Artillery	Air Defense Artillery
Prior Deployment Experience	2 years	4 years	3 years

Choose ONLY one individual: _____

In a couple of sentences, please describe the individual who, in your opinion, is the most suited for this vacancy:

When considering various units, how important to you are each of the following factors for making your choice?

Feature of Specific Unit	Rating				
	1	2	3	4	5
	Not at all Important	Slightly Important	Somewhat Important	Very Important	Extremely Important
Period of Availability	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Military branch	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Prior deployment experience	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Component	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Civilian-acquired skill	<input type="checkbox"/>				

Conditional Logit Model

The conditional logit models the probability of observing the stated choice as a function of the levels of each alternative's characteristics.

Formally, the model is

$$\Pr("i" \text{ chosen} \mid x, \beta) = \frac{e^{x_i \beta}}{\sum_j e^{x_j \beta}},$$

where the probability that choice i is chosen from among the $j = 1, \dots, 3$ alternatives depend on the levels of the characteristics of each alternative represented by $x_j = (x_{1j}, x_{2j}, \dots, x_{Kj})$ and the weighting coefficients associated with each characteristic. The weighting coefficients $\beta = (\beta_1, \beta_2, \dots, \beta_K)$ are estimated from the sample data. In the example in Table 1.1, each unit is indexed by j , and $K = 4$, with each x_k representing a particular unit characteristic.

The motivation of the model is that the respondent can rank the alternatives on an underlying (continuous) scale, and, at each choice occasion, chooses the alternative with the greatest scale value.¹ Because the researcher cannot perfectly observe the preferences of the decisionmaker, the scale is assumed to be composed of two components: the value known to the decisionmaker (given by $\beta_1 x_{i1} + \beta_2 x_{i2} + \dots + \beta_K x_{iK}$ for alternative i), and an error term that captures all of the elements unobserved by the researcher.² As a result, the probability of a given choice is modeled.

For more information on choice experiments and appropriate statistical models, refer to Hensher, Rose, and Greene.³

¹ In economics, this scale is represented by a utility function that represents the ordinal preferences of the decisionmaker.

² In the conditional logit model, the error term is assumed to be Type I Extreme Value.

³ Hensher, Rose, and Greene, 2005.